00:01:05.650 --> 00:01:10.849 Anne Christie: Hello, everyone. My name is Ann Christy, and I'm a policy associate at spur. 00:01:10.870 --> 00:01:25.669 Anne Christie: Thank you so much for joining us for this digital discourse today. Many of you here today are spur members. So thank you for your support. If you are not a member, I encourage you to join to support spurs, ongoing work and using education policy analysis. 00:01:25.750 --> 00:01:38.509 Anne Christie: an advocacy to make our cities and regions more prosperous, sustainable, and equitable places to live. Your financial support enables us to continue our work, including the hosting of programs like today's. 4 00:01:38.710 --> 00:01:47.030 Anne Christie: you'll find more information about membership online@spur.org slash join. We have another digital discourse scheduled for tomorrow. 00:01:47.110 --> 00:01:59.469 Anne Christie: Join us for our virtual program. We will be looking at the effects of spillover parking and potential solutions for the issue. You can register, forget real about spillover parking at the link in the chat. 00:02:00.360 --> 00:02:07.269 Anne Christie: Today's digital discourse is titled, Realizing Oakland projects through enhanced infrastructure financing districts. 7 00:02:07.500 --> 00:02:19.229 Anne Christie: enhanced infrastructure. Financing districts known as Eifs are a relatively new tool for funding city projects and revitalization efforts without increasing local taxes 00:02:19.450 --> 00:02:26.810 Anne Christie: once established in a specified area. Eifs direct a

portion of future property taxes to local projects.

q

00:02:26.830 --> 00:02:33.220

Anne Christie: such as affordable housing developments, infrastructure improvements, and climate adaptation measures.

10

00:02:33.350 --> 00:02:44.410

Anne Christie: The Oakland City Council is exploring establishing Eifs in both West and East Oakland to help fund affordable housing and communities plagued by inequitable housing policy.

11

00:02:45.260 --> 00:02:56.970

Anne Christie: Today's Forum will be moderated by Josh Simon Josh has over 40 years of experience in the community development field. He is currently senior advisor at the Community Art Stabilization Trust.

12

00:02:56.990 --> 00:03:02.770

Anne Christie: which focuses on creating permanent affordability, facilities for arts and culture.

13

00:03:02.870 --> 00:03:08.779

Anne Christie: He spent 20 of the last 30 years working with the East Bay Asian Local Development Corporation.

14

00:03:08.790 --> 00:03:18.700

Anne Christie: and he was director of real estate, consulting at the Northern California Community Loan Fund, where he advised nonprofits on planning and financing their facilities

15

00:03:18.830 --> 00:03:30.220

Anne Christie: along the way. He served 13 years as an elected School Board member for Emoryville Unified School district and served on Emory Emeryville's Redevelopment Successor Agency Oversight Committee.

16

00:03:30.340 --> 00:03:46.169

Anne Christie: Josh holds A. BA. In architecture from Uc Berkeley and a master in science, in real estate development from Mit Josh is also a long-term spur board member, for which we are very grateful. Thank you so much for moderating, Josh. With that I'll pass it to you to introduce our panelists.

17

00:03:47.700 --> 00:03:54.069

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Thank thank you.

And and before I get that comments in the chat about it. 00:03:54.210 --> 00:03:59.990 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Northern California Community Loan Fund is now known as community vision. So that's that's 00:04:00.580 --> 00:04:01.879 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: part of my bio. 20 00:04:02.040 --> 00:04:09.970 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: I'm very excited to introduce Erin Roseman and Council Member 21 00:04:10.120 --> 00:04:12.920 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Harold Fife. For this panel 22 00:04:12.940 --> 00:04:17.540 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Aaron currently serves as the director of finance 23 00:04:17.630 --> 00:04:19.279 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: for the city of Oakland. 24 00:04:19.360 --> 00:04:35.740 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Prior to this role she served as chief finance officer for the transpay joint Powers authority. She holds a master's of public administration and master of city and regional planning both from University of Texas. 25 00:04:36.210 --> 00:04:37.770 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Arlington. 26 00:04:37.820 --> 00:04:50.210 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And she has over 20 years of experience in finance and government. Aaron's going to start us off by explaining. What is this odd tool that was invented

27

00:04:50.420 --> 00:05:01.299

```
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: about 10 or 15
years ago, and has been seldom used in California. But has, I believe,
some potential, and we're excited to hearing about that potential
28
00:05:01.450 --> 00:05:08.300
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and after that
we'll be hearing from Council, member of Carol Fife.
29
00:05:08.510 --> 00:05:16.349
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Oakland City
Council, member Cal. 5 represents District 3 in downtown and West
Oakland.
30
00:05:16.360 --> 00:05:27.580
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: The priorities
include providing low income housing and finding permanent solutions
to address the homeless crisis, supporting essential workers
31
00:05:27.660 --> 00:05:30.469
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and preserving
Oakland's historical
32
00:05:30.490 --> 00:05:34.839
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and cultural spaces
for black and brown communities
33
00:05:35.050 --> 00:05:38.500
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: as former director
of Ace
34
00:05:38.610 --> 00:05:39.800
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Oakland.
35
00:05:40.290 --> 00:05:49.200
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: She helped to found
moms for housing and pass legislation at the State and local level, to
build collective power for tenants.
36
00:05:49.260 --> 00:06:02.209
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Carol's recent
```

legislative and electoral accomplishments include passing Oaklands

emergency eviction, moratorium and preventing dangerous Cpi rent increases 37 00:06:02.290 --> 00:06:08.759 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and passage of progressive business tax and funding for social 38 00:06:09.630 --> 00:06:17.900 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: housing ballot measures. So with that, I'm going to turn it over to Aaron to explain 39 00:06:17.910 --> 00:06:22.120 Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: this new and exotic funding approach. 40 00:06:24.900 --> 00:06:36.410 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Thank you. I appreciate the introduction and the opportunity to present this to spur into all the people who are listening. It is an exciting tool. And I'm excited about it for for the city of Oakland. 41 00:06:36.450 --> 00:06:40.989 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: So I'll go ahead and share my screen and walk you through presentation. 42 00:06:46.790 --> 00:06:47.979 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Can everyone see 43 00:06:49.190 --> 00:06:52.160 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: that's good? 44 00:06:52.410 --> 00:06:59.579 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Alright? So what is an enhanced infrastructure financing district? Or E, Ifd. 45 00:07:00.220 --> 00:07:12.050

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: I'll give you an overview and a quick summary Eif is just California's name for tax increment, financing and

tax increment. Financing is economic development

00:07:12.120 --> 00:07:41.989 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: mechanism where a geographical area is targeted to capture the increase of property tax resulting from new development that's used to subsidize development in that established area. So them shorter terms. You have new development that equals greater property value, that gives you more property taxes that you reinvest in the same district, and it sort of cycles upon itself. To create the momentum that you need to to keep the 47 00:07:42.030 --> 00:07:44.320 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: greater investment in that geography. 48 00:07:44.390 --> 00:07:56.489 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: The increment part is the difference between the baseline property value and the new property value that is created, and that that differential is called the tax increment. 49 00:07:57.080 --> 00:08:03.210 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: So I'll walk you through. A little history and some of the key components of an Eif 50 00:08:03.330 --> 00:08:06.029 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: eifs 51 00:08:06.290 --> 00:08:35.549 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: were created in 2,014 through and it's in the California local government code. It is a new tool after the dissolution of redevelopment. So the redevelopment agencies were dissolved or repealed in 2,011, and eifs were created by the legislature to still provide a financing mechanism that allows for increased 52 00:08:35.620 --> 00:08:36.409 that 53 $00:08:37.010 \longrightarrow 00:08:48.430$ Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: increased developing. The first Eif was formed in 2017 and then the first city county Eif formed in 2,019. 54

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: So a city can pursue an Eif by itself,

00:08:48.440 --> 00:08:55.270

or a city and county can both pursue an Eif

00:08:55.570 --> 00:09:14.800

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: The legal definition of Eif is a governmental entity established by city or county for both, that carries out a plan within a defined area to construct, improve, and rehabilitate infrastructure and affordable housing, and that that definition is in the California local government code.

56

00:09:16.290 --> 00:09:23.710

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: To get into some of the nuts and bolts of it. When we talk about the baseline, about baseline

57

00:09:23.990 --> 00:09:47.850

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: value, if value. That's what I'm trying to do. And that's what I'm trying to do. And then I'm going to. This is, that's not what we're going to do. That's what we're looking for. And that's what we're going to do is we're going to talk about that. And then we're going to talk about that, and then we're going to talk about that, and then we'll see if we can do that, and then we'll see if we can do that, and then we'll see if we can do that, and then we'll see if we can do talk about that

58

00:09:48.010 --> 00:09:52.090

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: in this small area will create a larger amount of value.

59

00:09:52.270 --> 00:10:03.010

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: The property tax revenues grow as a as a result of the new development and the revenues over and above the fixed space year where we started

60

00:10:03.770 --> 00:10:27.679

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: are captured to support the public infrastructure and investment. And for affordable housing can be one of those components generally the Eif, the district, the financing District is created for 45 years, and that the local government code allows for that and after the district dissolves, then all of the revenue that was created. This additional

61

00:10:27.680 --> 00:10:34.540

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: large assessed value then goes back into the city, and for the county's general funds.

00:10:35.080 --> 00:10:48.989

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Other taxes like sales and transfer tax, flow to continue to flow to the city and the county throughout the project lifecycle. So they sales, tax and transfer taxes are not captured within. Eif.

63

00:10:50.990 --> 00:11:10.329

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: This is a visual, another visual of you know. How do the revenues work? If you look at this bottom section here the fix base, that's where we start. And then you have these catalytic developments that create additional value property value. And if you didn't have this

64

00:11:10.330 --> 00:11:32.010

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: value created by the district, then you this, this money would never exist. You start with your fix base. Your development creates this additional value. Other multiplier effects happen. There's other revenues that can be created. Sales tax transfer text, transit, occupancy, tax gross receipts as a result or offshoot

65

00:11:32.010 --> 00:11:50.330

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: of this black slice that is created additional value, and then, once the district is over, all of these revenues are then available to the city and or the county to their general purpose funds, or this specific special funds as they've created.

66

00:11:50.600 --> 00:11:58.019

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: So you the mechanism harnesses a smaller base, and then creates additional revenues.

67

00:11:59.950 --> 00:12:21.029

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: One example, and how the city of Oakland hopes to utilize this tool. Is in West Oakland, and this is an example area West Oakland has, as in this description here, this ex. This map has about 6,300 parcels and about 2 billion dollars worth Annette

68

00:12:21.040 --> 00:12:28.299

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: value. You would take some sub-section of this and then create a E Ifd to

69

00:12:28.850 --> 00:12:31.870

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: to springboard additional revenues.

70

00:12:33.630 --> 00:12:42.959

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: One of the key components of the Eif is the creation of a public financing authority, and that is the legislative body that governs the Ifd. You can

71

00:12:43.050 --> 00:12:57.260

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: think of it as a Mini, a Mini city council or board of supervisors. It's another legislative board that manages this specific district. If it is a eif that

72

00:12:57.560 --> 00:13:27.259

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: that has county and city participation. Then the County Board and City Council, and 2 public members, or members from the county members from the city council, and 2 public members become the governing body of the Eif this public financing authority directs the preparation of the infrastructure, financing plan and holds public hearings. It authorizes the issue and some bonds, and it conducts annual reviews and overseas independent audits.

73

00:13:29.950 --> 00:13:52.050

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: the infrastructure financing plan. So you need to know what it is that you're trying to finance what it is you're trying to accomplish what it is you're trying to do. In this eif so the infrastructure financing plan is the plan. That that lays that out. It's has to be independently adopted by the city accounting if it's a dual participation. But

74

00:13:52.050 --> 00:14:15.269

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: it really describes the public capital facilities or the projects. That are coming with community wide significance. That will be finance. So where are we going? If we're capturing the revenue. What are we going to use this revenue on? What is it going to build? What can you expect out of this financing district? And this plan is is what you can expect.

75

00:14:15.750 --> 00:14:23.369

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: It projects the Mac maximum annual tax increment. And it limits the dot amount of dollars to be collected.

76

00:14:23.380 --> 00:14:34.490

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: It specifies the expiration date. So are we going to go to 45 years, or could it be do you want a 30 year eifed? But the plan tells how long?

77

00:14:34.750 --> 00:14:47.540

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: how long we're gonna go for. And then it includes a fiscal impact analysis. So these are, this is the crux of your E. Ifd, what is it that you're going to get out of the creation of this?

78

00:14:49.350 --> 00:15:11.010

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: One another tool that's generally used with an E. Ifd is a community facilities district. So you have this financing district, and then you add on top of it a community facilities. District the California term or the legislation that authorize this this Melarus. And so sometimes it's called a Melarus district.

79

00:15:11.230 --> 00:15:18.279

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: mellow, and Ruth being for the legislators that author authored that that legislation.

80

00:15:18.460 --> 00:15:43.210

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: In this community facilities. District or Cfd, all of the property owners within the geography within the district have to agree to impose an additional special tax on their properties above, over and above their property tax. So we all agree to tax ourselves on an additional fee, so that we can help pay for construction and maintenance of public facilities. Public facilities could be

81

00:15:43.210 --> 00:15:51.050

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: fire stations, parks could be, roadways could be water, sewer pipes, public. Those are public facilities.

82

00:15:51.400 --> 00:16:05.460

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: it the Cfd secures revenues, and it allow it can allow developers and property owners to secure inexpensive upfront financing for for infrastructure.

83

00:16:08.390 --> 00:16:16.830

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Usually a Cfd is combined with an E. Ifd, because it's a try and true approach there they would have the

84 00:16:16.930 --> 00:16:32.600 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: boundaries. Geographical boundaries. The Eif captures the incremental property tax revenue and then the Cfd is can issue or will issue the bonds that are backed by the special tax and or the property tax revenue 85 $00:16:32.600 \longrightarrow 00:16:51.289$ Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: incremental revenues captured by the Efd. Are intended to be adequate enough to cover dead service, and that's important when you may be concerned about, how does the Eif or Cfd, and all of these activities? Affected the city or the county's general purpose fund. 00:16:51.290 --> 00:17:02.710 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: It is these incremental tax revenues that are that protect your general purpose from from being exposed as a result of the creation of these. 87 00:17:02.720 --> 00:17:03.950 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: this district? 88 00:17:04.290 --> 00:17:13.449 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: If we look to the market like, how how well with this be received, how? How can this actually occur? 89 00:17:13.510 --> 00:17:26.609 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: CIA Cfd bonds are well accepted in the debt market investors know about them are comfortable with them, and they aren't difficult to sale. You can generate money 90 00:17:26.660 --> 00:17:28.479 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: using this mechanism. 91 00:17:28.600 --> 00:17:46.650 Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Cfp bonds are generally non recourse to the issuing entity. And that just basically means that you can create

a wall, a firewall between the general purpose fund and this Eif or Cfd, so there's no recourse, no results. To the general purpose fund

00:17:47.000 --> 00:17:58.489

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: revenue shortfalls. If they're if they happen, although they're rare, they're back stopped by the developer, not necessarily by the city or county general fund.

93

00:17:58.960 --> 00:18:08.729

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: This combination is generally a recipe for success, and it's been used in other California eifs that have been formed today.

94

00:18:11.260 --> 00:18:39.809

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: So I'll take you through the process. How long does it take to create a eipd 3 to 5 years. The local government code lays out all the specific set steps, all the plans, the number of public hearings, the requirement, the legal requirements that you have to go through in order to create one, and so I'll go through them pretty quickly. To not bore everyone with all the legality of it all.

95

00:18:40.020 --> 00:19:09.269

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Let's say we started the Eif today late 2,023. We're in August to 2023. You have to make sure that the ge geography that you choose if it, if it's in compliance with the former redevelopment agency. The affected tax entities have to designate members of the public financing authority. So if the city and the county are in there, then we have to designate who's going to be on this board? Who's gonna lead the pfa.

96

00:19:09.290 --> 00:19:22.300

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Then there's a resolution of intent. And so we go through the city's process of agendizing stuff, having public conversations and adopting a resolution of intent.

97

00:19:22.310 --> 00:19:38.339

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: You have to create or form the public financing authority, and as you can see, these steps all take a little bit of time, one to 2 months, 2 to 4 months, 12 to 24 months. And the timing is really

98

00:19:39.570 --> 00:19:54.530

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: driven by the amount of conversation. How well thought out you want this plan to be understanding your real goals and the outcomes that you're trying to accomplish, and then getting them on paper and following the legal rubric.

00:19:56.330 --> 00:19:59.720

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Once you have done your

100

00:20:00.330 --> 00:20:14.719

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: your resolution of intent, you have to do, noticing you have to do another resolution. You have to consult all the taxing entities you have to prepare the financing plan. You want to know what we're all agreeing to. What are we gonna kick

101

00:20:15.890 --> 00:20:34.940

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: you have noticing for the Ifp, you have meetings for the Ifp, you have a public hearing, number one, public hearing number 2, and it can be a third public hearing. So there's lots of opportunity for public input public comment. Understanding what it is that we're truly trying to accomplish.

102

00:20:35.320 --> 00:20:41.149

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: And then, as you go through all of those public hearings and the creation of things.

103

00:20:41.200 --> 00:21:04.900

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: there's a we have to divide up how the taxes are going to be applied. And as any taxpayer you want to be heard, you want to know how my taxes are going to be used, and so, if you protest. If you protest the plan, then there's another public hearing we have to notice you have you get to participate, and then, if it does not go. Well, then, there's if there's a majority protest, then there's an election

104

 $00:21:05.030 \longrightarrow 00:21:27.770$

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: and so if you go through all of these things, on the easy path. If you have all your ducts in a row, or lined up pretty quickly, you could be at the 3 year mark. If there's hiccups in between lots of discourse. Then you're closer to the 5 year mark. So if we were going through this, it could be early. 2,027, first quarter, 2,027 to make all of this happen.

105

00:21:28.220 --> 00:21:34.130

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: And you want to go through this in a well thought out manner, so that you end up with a good product in the end.

00:21:35.700 --> 00:21:51.699

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Oh, I kind of skip through this. If there is a majority, protest? No, then we can go ahead and adopt the resolution to form it. If not, then we have the election. Within 90 days. If there is a majority protest and 25 to

107

00:21:51.850 --> 00:21:57.870

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: yeah. Your land owners all have to, you know, have to participate and agree to

108

00:21:58.050 --> 00:22:02.260

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: to additional, to tax themselves and to put themselves in this sort of district.

109

00:22:03.460 --> 00:22:24.310

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Some of the key pieces in doing forming a Eif are having economic consultants that can provide good scenarios. Help you figure out the correct geography do all of the parcel analysis. Individual parcel, parcel analysis, and there has to be some catalytic development.

110

00:22:24.310 --> 00:22:36.650

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: This is the development of the development plan the thing that's going to drive the increment. And then, of course, there's always the public approvals. The County board, the City board,

111

00:22:36.920 --> 00:22:53.800

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: the city council and all of the public comment that goes along with it. And so there you have it, E. Ifd's explained hopefully. Be demystified. Hopefully, you understand? A little bit more. And now we'll turn it over to our wonderful Council member

112

00:22:53.980 --> 00:22:55.200

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Carol 5

113

00:22:55.900 --> 00:23:06.879

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: act. Actually, if we could just take a a minute before we we go there. I wanted to. There's a few questions in the chat. Very quickly.

00:23:06.930 --> 00:23:10.000

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Just to be clear a

115

00:23:10.260 --> 00:23:15.870

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: eif is not a business improvement district. That's a different

116

00:23:16.110 --> 00:23:28.670

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: financing and business improvement district is when you, a group of property owners, agrees to tax themselves for improvements in the neighborhood. So that's a that's a different thing.

117

00:23:29.060 --> 00:23:41.000

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: But with that quick answer to that question, let me turn it over to the council member, and then we can go to discussion.

118

00:23:42.540 --> 00:24:02.710

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: Well, thank you for detailing that, and thank you for even pointing us to the chat. Josh, I'm not realizing there's so much information in there. I'll definitely have to check that out. And thank you, Director Roseman, for being super clear just about the foundational structure of what Eifs are and how they can be used.

119

00:24:02.710 --> 00:24:19.799

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: My goal as the elected representative of one of the districts that has a lot of development occurring all the time, but also a great deal of toxic land and a very diverse group of residents that

120

00:24:19.820 --> 00:24:44.469

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: range from very wealthy to having no income at all. It's important that when we talk about reimagining because you hear that often. Reimagining how we do certain things as elected officials. It's important to understand that we have this new tool where we can reimagine how we engage with giving our residents the most important critical needs. That they're asking for.

121

00:24:44.470 --> 00:25:00.050

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: Affordable housing is one

of those things, but affordable housing hasn't always been in reach of many people who desperately need it. One of the populations that we are intended intending to serve are our unhoused population.

122

00:25:00.190 --> 00:25:24.169

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: that currently don't have resources or abilities to afford market rate units, or even very low income units. But we all also have workforce housing many of our workers in the city and the county can't afford to live or buy in the city where they work, and that has a huge impact on the services that we deliver as a city of Oakland. So I have the task

123

00:25:24.170 --> 00:25:44.209

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: of not only understanding where all of those diverse populations are, and what their needs are, but then, finding the tools that we can use to ensure that we can provide what they need in order to thrive, and that is my goal is to lift all boats in the city of Oakland, and in April of 2023 I created

124

00:25:44.450 --> 00:25:51.150

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: an info report in conjunction with the Department of Race and Equity and other city departments to address the impacts

125

00:25:51.170 --> 00:26:14.060

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: of redlining on my district, because we know in in West Oakland there were billions and billions of dollars extracted from our small business community, and through the demolition of 5,100 homes in West Oakland that has had a financial impact on every aspect of life right in District 3,

126

00:26:14.060 --> 00:26:32.250

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: and it is our responsibility as the agencies that participated in that wealth extraction to reinvest, so that not only that particular area of West Oakland can thrive, but also the entire district in the city at large. And when we do that, and when we use an eif

127

00:26:32.250 --> 00:26:50.720

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: as a tool to reinvest in in this area of the city. It will have regional benefits. And we know this because, these tools have been used all across the State of California all across the country. But specifically, since the inception of this new tool to replace redevelopment in 2,014

00:26:50.840 --> 00:26:54.889

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: cities throughout the State, have used it to engage

129

00:26:54.940 --> 00:27:14.720

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: creating all kinds of benefit for their cities, and Oakland is going to be hopefully if we do all of the steps that, Director Roseman said thoughtfully, and intentional. We'll be able to utilize that to address not only the affordability crisis but also boost our economic vitality in the area.

130

00:27:14.750 --> 00:27:20.849

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: One of the things I really wanted to point to was the Black new deal. If you go to my website on the

131

00:27:20.880 --> 00:27:38.809

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: at Www. Dot, Carol. 5.org forward, slash, platform, forward, slash, black new deal. We get into some of the specifics around the number of brown fields in in the district that we want to be able to remediate through the use of these funds. In order to create.

132

00:27:38.840 --> 00:27:48.589

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: increase and create more development opportunities in the district. But there are key developments that are in the pipeline that have

133

00:27:48.970 --> 00:28:07.190

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: their entitlements ready to go. And I'm very excited about the potential of what an Eif can do around our Seventh Street corridor in West Oakland for revitalizing that particular area. There are currently several businesses that are looking to the city and the county for support

134

00:28:07.230 --> 00:28:22.640

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: right around the Bart station. So it's transit oriented development, which means that we can bring in additional density to bring in additional units, but also to bring in new industry, biotech, and things that are currently on the horizon to

00:28:22.890 --> 00:28:35.339

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: boost the economies of of our city of California to really make that an area in a destination for not only our existing residents, but also new business to come in.

136

00:28:35.360 --> 00:28:43.910

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: It's important to me that the slogans that we use in Oakland, being that Oakland is a resistant city.

137

00:28:44.160 --> 00:29:01.180

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: they are actually made manifest. So what that means is when we talk about development with without displacement. When we talk about housing as a human right, we are making those real. And it. It's more than just a notion to say we want, think these things to become reality.

138

00:29:01.210 --> 00:29:21.009

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: But now that we have the tools to do so, we have to exercise, and we have to use them. I'm not gonna get into details about the validity of utilizing this tool and other places of the city. I know we might have conversation about the use of it for a waterfall front Ballpark district. But my position is, if it's good enough

139

00:29:21.010 --> 00:29:34.680

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: for a sports team, then it's good enough for the residents of the district, and that is the kind of energy and the the passion that we need moving forward to make this a reality in the city of Oakland, because in Poysencia.

140

00:29:34.680 --> 00:29:54.940

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: Santa Rosa, and all the other cities that have implemented eifs, I think Oakland has a lot of exciting opportunities, and I am proud to represent a district where those opportunities can really really be exploited for the benefit of the the people who've been left behind who have not had a seat at the table, and

141

00:29:55.540 --> 00:30:02.279

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: I think I just wanted to find in the stakeholders who want to be a part of the process. Transparency is key.

```
142
```

00:30:02.610 --> 00:30:24.990

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: and working with community is key. Getting all stakeholders on board is is critical, and I'm proud to say that we have supporters at all levels of government, including a potential strong partner in our county Board of Supervisors, with with a few of our supervisors that have already month their support to the potential of of this tool. So

143

00:30:25.050 --> 00:30:46.530

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: I'm gonna turn it back over to Josh Simon, because I know there will be lots of questions. But just stay tuned, because right now the city of Oakland has put out an Rfp. I believe, and and Director Rosemary. Correct me if I'm wrong that Rfps for the aspects of the Eif, that Mayor, then council member. But now Mayor Shankau and I, brought forward

144

00:30:46.530 --> 00:31:08.529

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: earlier in the legislative year, are moving forward, and we will, if we haven't already select the economic advisors that are helping us put together the feasibility of creating an East Oakland, West Oakland, or an East Oakland only, or West Oakland eif, so that is on the horizon, and coming soon, and I will turn it over to Joshua.

145

00:31:09.410 --> 00:31:11.620

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Thank you so much councilmember?

146

00:31:11.720 --> 00:31:16.600

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: so there's some terrific questions here, and

147

00:31:16.790 --> 00:31:22.310

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: I'm going to start in order to answer this first question about

148

00:31:22.320 --> 00:31:23.390

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Pat.

149

00:31:24.530 --> 00:31:26.289

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Does the

00:31:28.330 --> 00:31:57.760

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: How does the tax increment effect other taxes? Aaron? My, my understanding of the way the county the State sets up property taxes is the property taxes that you pay on your regular payment are split between different agencies. So my understanding is, the city gets a little more than 25% of the base amount. That's the top half of your tax bill.

151

00:31:58.850 --> 00:32:03.350

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And and the county gets about 16% of that.

152

00:32:03.610 --> 00:32:07.860

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And then the rest are split between Bart and A/C. Transit schools

153

00:32:07.870 --> 00:32:15.489

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and other agencies, and then at the bottom of your bill is other bonds and assessments that are put on.

154

00:32:15.520 --> 00:32:21.110

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: So this doesn't impact any of the other assessments, as I understand it.

155

00:32:21.170 --> 00:32:30.889

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And it only affects those agencies that choose to put their future taxes from a specific area

156

00:32:31.190 --> 00:32:40.599

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: into the assessment. So if the city chose and the county together in West Oakland

157

00:32:40.700 --> 00:32:53.590

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: decided to put that their portion, and that's about 40% of your tax bill. but just the increases doesn't affect the

00:32:53.800 --> 00:32:59.309

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: existing taxes. Just future increases. Is that a fair representation?

159

00:33:00.060 --> 00:33:16.779

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Yes, that that's pretty close. About 35 of the one. Yes, it's above the 25 like you said, but we get about 2033 to 35% of the one

160

00:33:16.890 --> 00:33:23.759

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: more than the last time I checked this. So that's excellent. So so that means that

161

00:33:23.950 --> 00:33:37.970

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: the other 8, the school district that any agency that does not choose to put their and to to invest their taxes into this. They're not. They're unaffected. So to to answer that question

162

00:33:38.090 --> 00:33:41.480

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And then the mellow ruse,

163

00:33:41.930 --> 00:33:46.240

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: tool is really something that a developer puts on their project.

164

00:33:46.260 --> 00:33:54.819

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: So, as I understand it. So if a specific developer in West Oakland wanted to tax there themselves.

165

00:33:54.910 --> 00:34:00.260

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and then use that additional taxes or a bond

166

00:34:01.490 --> 00:34:11.540

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: that could be done, and the taxes from both the tax increment, and the mailers can be bonded to raise money to invest in the project. Is that correct?

00:34:11.780 --> 00:34:20.600

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: That's correct. Alright

168

00:34:20.670 --> 00:34:44.140

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: nature of this particular tool is being able to leverage what we can utilize from the city of Oakland for developers to attract other funding from other sources. And that's gonna be really key when affordable developers are trying to pull together their capital stack, to be able to build the type of housing that we still desperately need, that we haven't been able to

169

00:34:44.150 --> 00:34:47.649

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: to manage over the last at least 2 decades.

170

00:34:48.980 --> 00:35:03.549

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Kim Kim Thompson. We we don't have another speaker. So this is our chance to go through, and we have some terrific questions, although I know Kim Thompson is very knowledgeable on this, and she's asked

171

00:35:03.630 --> 00:35:05.960

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: if I

172

00:35:07.010 --> 00:35:12.600

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: if eif for East Oakland has been discussed.

173

00:35:12.710 --> 00:35:23.260

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And she mentioned it back in November the city Council entered a resolution of interest, looking at the Ifd for West Oakland. But I wasn't sure if there was any discussion of Easter.

174

00:35:24.610 --> 00:35:46.620

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Yes, so the Resolution did say, East and West Oakland, and a city wide for us to do a feasibility, study, or analysis to look at all versions. In this forum, because we had Council Member 5 and West Oakland. I just put an example of only West Oakland. But yes, we were. Administration was directed to look at east and west and citywide

00:35:47.140 --> 00:36:01.989

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: terrific, and thank you thank you for that question, and I have been in conversation with the individual who put that in the chat. And so we are not leaving out East Oakland in terms of the areas that we are reviewing. Thank you, Director Rosemary, for sharing that

176

 $00:36:02.000 \longrightarrow 00:36:24.949$

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: because my, my goal is to look at areas of deep disinvestment that have shining potential projects that could help spur the economic development in that particular area. The Coliseum is one of those spaces. Once again. The projects that are being developed around the West Oakland, Bart. Or other areas.

177

00:36:24.950 --> 00:36:41.170

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: I will state for the record that I am concerned about a city wide Eif, and the challenges that could come from utilizing the entire city as a potential district, because II believe that is too broad. I've had

178

00:36:41.260 --> 00:37:00.939

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: a few conversations, very shallow conversations, but a few conversations with Director Roseman about that, and that is not my particular intention as a Council member who brought this legislation forward. But I am looking at hyper targeted areas that could definitely benefit from economic development and affordable housing.

179

00:37:01.930 --> 00:37:05.869

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Well, and and my understanding is, since it's it's

180

00:37:06.220 --> 00:37:07.390

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: the district

181

00:37:08.320 --> 00:37:12.909

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: it captures the taxes that are increased above the base amount.

182

00:37:13.020 --> 00:37:21.740

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: So if you have a base amount of taxes, it. It's it's captured in the future. But that

future taxes is also needed to run the city.

192

00:38:17.450 --> 00:38:26.960

```
00:37:21.810 --> 00:37:36.020
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: So the theory is
that you can capture portions of that increase and invest them back in
to be able to have more taxes in the future, so that it's in the city
investing in itself.
184
00:37:36.150 --> 00:37:39.049
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: But but if the city
invested
185
00:37:39.060 --> 00:37:45.149
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: everything it has,
then we don't have any money for increase, as I understand it.
186
00:37:45.340 --> 00:37:54.150
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: so that leads me to
robin barrels question, which is the seems to be a tension between
187
00:37:55.050 --> 00:38:01.220
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: the tax exemption
for affordable housing and creating more more taxes.
188
00:38:01.270 --> 00:38:02.770
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: So
189
00:38:03.220 --> 00:38:09.809
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: if the idea is to
create additional taxes to make up for the investment in.
190
00:38:09.940 --> 00:38:13.220
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: But the affordable
housing is tax exempt.
191
00:38:13.420 --> 00:38:17.109
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: How? Where does
that additional
```

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Where does that additional come come from? And my my understanding is that all of the money would not. It would not be 100 affordable

193

00:38:26.990 --> 00:38:32.359

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: housing that there will be other investments that generate additional future taxes. But

194

00:38:32.410 --> 00:38:35.589

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: councilmember. you want to start with that one.

195

00:38:35.740 --> 00:38:38.159

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: I'll just start by saying that

196

00:38:38.430 --> 00:38:44.430

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: part of being able to have development, especially housing development without displacement

197

00:38:44.520 --> 00:39:06.400

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: means that we have to have developments that can subsidize the the tax revenue that we don't receive as a city that results from having affordable units. And that's part of the reason why the ballot measure that I passed around social housing is really important, because it. It will be through some of those higher rents

198

00:39:06.400 --> 00:39:16.249

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: that support being able to subsidize some of the lower rents, but in terms of the the deeper tension around

199

00:39:16.450 --> 00:39:25.110

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: the taxes and and what might be lost, I would definitely turn that over to our professional director, Roseman and and

200

00:39:25.150 --> 00:39:35.140

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: I don't. I used to call you Director Simon, because our relationship started when you were at evaluate. But, I definitely would like you all to weigh in on this as

well.

201

00:39:35.810 --> 00:39:45.220

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Absolutely so. You don't do affordable housing in isolation. You don't build a neighborhood in isolation. There's always

202

00:39:45.350 --> 00:39:59.309

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: tangential development that complementary development. If you build housing, you need a you need a grocery store. You need some retail. You need other things that are going to increase the tax base and that additional

203

00:39:59.310 --> 00:40:16.229

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: development that is not tax exempt. Helps to offset the tax exempt version or developments affordable housing, and so you need the other developments there, along with the affordable housing to make it successful.

204

00:40:16.620 --> 00:40:21.160

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: And that's how you avoid the tension or even it out.

205

00:40:22.130 --> 00:40:26.009

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Yes, I back in the under redevelopment, which is

206

00:40:26.230 --> 00:40:34.320

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: the the old version of of this redevelopment I believe, had a 25%

207

00:40:34.550 --> 00:40:39.379

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: requirement, although we, we always fought for a 30 or 40%

208

00:40:39.510 --> 00:41:02.539

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: requirement. But the the tension came back to that. You need the market rate projects to generate the taxes, and ideally, you're taking land that has very little value now, and adding to it, I have to say, on that point councilmember fife mentioned toxic remediation. Emeryville is an amazing

```
209
00:41:02.680 --> 00:41:17.500
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: example of a city
that used its redevelopment money to use its future tax increment to
clean up environmental hazards which have made a lot of the
development that's happened in Emoryville
210
00:41:17.540 --> 00:41:21.800
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: possible. I'd still
advocate for more affordable housing there as well.
211
00:41:21.810 --> 00:41:24.899
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: That's another.
That's another conversation.
212
00:41:25.170 --> 00:41:29.389
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Let's move on to
213
00:41:30.120 --> 00:41:38.950
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: as the city used
an eif alongside other funding sources
214
00:41:38.960 --> 00:41:43.909
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and mechanisms,
including Federal sources and and ly tech
215
00:41:44.060 --> 00:42:02.499
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: I do I. The city
has not used any, ifd at all. So this has not been done. But my
understanding is under redevelop that that all of the tools that we
used under redevelopment and all the combinations can still be used.
216
00:42:02.790 --> 00:42:04.679
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: is that
217
00:42:04.950 --> 00:42:05.730
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: I
218
00:42:06.040 --> 00:42:07.730
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: is that right,
```

```
Erin?
```

00:42:08.430 --> 00:42:10.479

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: So I think we have agreement on that.

220

00:42:11.320 --> 00:42:16.070

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: I the

221

00:42:16.780 --> 00:42:28.750

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: What recommendations and lessons learned? Would Oakland share with other jurisdictions as they consider establishing. This, I think it's too early yet.

222

00:42:29.400 --> 00:42:34.430

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: But But the councilmember fife, do you have any thoughts on that?

223

00:42:35.580 --> 00:42:55.850

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: Because we haven't begun our process. We're not into it yet. I think the question would be better posed in reverse, like, what lessons can we learn from the other cities around the State of California who've utilized a Ifd's as development tools. I think we need to have more conversations, and I plan on

224

00:42:55.850 --> 00:43:12.439

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: being over communicative along the journey, so that people can understand that this is intended to be a very transparent process, and we're not trying to do something rushed. But we want to be really thorough for me. It's it's of deep.

225

00:43:12.480 --> 00:43:18.390

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: deep concern that the communities who have experienced disinvestment.

226

00:43:18.540 --> 00:43:35.669

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: have to be at at the table. Around this I we talked a little about the impacts of redlining, but we don't see that we we don't often connect those impacts and the current history that works the current experiences

that we're having

227

00:43:35.670 --> 00:43:56.210

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: to diso disinvestment over decades. And so the the fact that in West Oakland is where a lot of the industrial sites are the fact that I've had to fight so hard for solutions around homelessness to the point of like literally having a breakdown in a city council meeting to say we need to figure out how to utilize

228

00:43:56.210 --> 00:44:20.660

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: toxic land, because every time I come up with a solution around how how to address homelessness, I'm told. Well, we can't do anything, because that land is toxic. At some point we have to do something about the land being toxic, and that has to stop being the reason why we can't create additional development. And the way that the State of California is moving if we want to recapture the out migration of

229

00:44:20.790 --> 00:44:28.499

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: high skilled individuals and just being the entrapment of people who cannot afford to leave

230

00:44:28.530 --> 00:44:47.349

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: we've we've got to provide the services that they so desperately need. And housing costs are one of the major reasons that people are leaving the State. So this is a tool that will allow us to do that, but also bring along additional community benefits. This can fund things like the Hoover Durant Library, a library that was removed

231

 $00:44:47.350 \longrightarrow 00:45:01.129$

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: years ago from from our city and serving up a very specific population it can also fund of another aspect of people's lives that is completely unaffordable to many, and that's

232

00:45:01.130 --> 00:45:21.979

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: quality childcare. So there are a number of community benefits that can come through the utilization of this tool. But the point is is that if we are going to utilize it, which I'm pushing, that we should. Obviously we've gotta get it right. We've got to do it right, and so part of doing it right means talking to other cities who have.

```
233
```

00:45:23.070 --> 00:45:28.799

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: There's a terrific question in the chat about, can can you do

234

00:45:28.910 --> 00:45:30.630

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: a disconnected

235

00:45:30.690 --> 00:45:36.260

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: yeah. Fds where they they're in different places. And

236

00:45:36.420 --> 00:45:56.060

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: yes, Eifs can be non contiguous. I'm not sure if that's what that is the question. Yes, Eifs don't have to be contiguous sites and some of the developers that I'm in conversation with around utilizing. And E Ifd as a development tool are suggesting that we utilize it because I think that if we

237

00:45:56.060 --> 00:46:09.999

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: can create something around transit in West Oakland, and also connect it to the development that's happening around the policy. And we can do something really powerful for communities who have not seen

238

00:46:10.070 --> 00:46:14.310

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: robust investment in a long, long time, and that is my goal.

239

 $00:46:14.610 \longrightarrow 00:46:16.110$

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: So let let me.

240

00:46:16.580 --> 00:46:25.570

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: So that brings up a really interesting question. Because, yeah, E, Ifd's work best, if there's a large increase in taxes over time.

241

00:46:25.760 --> 00:46:34.159

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and particularly they work best for projects that probably wouldn't happen for years if it wasn't for early investment.

```
242
00:46:34.340 --> 00:46:40.380
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: because there is no
increase in taxes if nothing gets built. So
243
00:46:40.800 --> 00:46:51.289
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: so what you're
saying then, is, we could, for example, take all of the developments
planned at different parts, stations, or other large developments
244
00:46:51.370 --> 00:46:53.069
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: where the community
245
00:46:53.410 --> 00:47:07.080
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: is excited about
the project happening. But the project needs early investment in order
to get there. So rather than waiting for the funds to become
available. This becomes another way to accelerate
246
00:47:07.220 --> 00:47:10.020
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: accelerate
247
00:47:10.170 --> 00:47:17.799
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: community deals and
generate extra money for the affordable housing. Is that a fair
description of that.
248
00:47:17.950 --> 00:47:22.960
Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: I think it. It is
definitely a fair description, and it's also
249
00:47:23.250 --> 00:47:38.259
Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: an unnecessary part of
the conversation. We have developments that are entitled around a few
of our park stations right now, not just in Eastern West Oakland, but
also Central Oakland. So it. It gives us
250
00:47:38.890 --> 00:48:03.470
```

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: kind of a head start or an advantage over some of the other cities, because a lot of rural cities are utilizing eifs as tools for economic development as well.

But Oakland is in a special zone, in, in and of itself, because of our access to mass transit. So II think it affords us several opportunities that other spaces don't have.

251

00:48:03.470 --> 00:48:15.209

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: and it allows developers to have this public and private partnership, so to speak, to to leverage additional resources that wouldn't otherwise be available.

252

00:48:16.190 --> 00:48:16.970

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Right?

253

00:48:17.580 --> 00:48:29.040

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And and maybe you could just take a minute to one of the speakers. Asked if you could describe, just to give people a sense of what are the sort of market rate developments that

254

00:48:29.310 --> 00:48:35.670

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: you know are generating the taxes, perhaps in your district that that we hope to fund.

255

00:48:37.670 --> 00:48:47.919

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Yeah, I'll have to revisit that when we send out the notes. Okay, that sounds good. The There's a question of

256

00:48:48.520 --> 00:48:49.430

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: is

257

00:48:49.940 --> 00:48:56.100

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: districts being used in other places. And what happens if if a developer goes bankrupt?

258

00:48:56.340 --> 00:49:01.010

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And I should say the it's it's a very good question.

259

00:49:01.020 --> 00:49:02.590

```
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and
260
00:49:03.080 --> 00:49:06.700
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: a lot of
261
00:49:07.610 --> 00:49:10.670
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: The same tools that
were used under redevelopment
262
00:49:10.690 --> 00:49:16.799
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: would be used for
this financing as well. So.
263
00:49:16.960 --> 00:49:17.640
aye.
264
00:49:18.000 --> 00:49:24.839
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: presumably there.
Well, in general, there's there's loan agreements that are attached to
the land, and
265
00:49:25.010 --> 00:49:34.540
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: that protect the
city. I don't know Erin. If you want to add to that in terms of how's
that? How is the city protected.
266
00:49:34.630 --> 00:49:38.630
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: or it's investments
into these developments?
267
00:49:39.880 --> 00:49:48.470
Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: So one of the tools are the Ddas are the
development disposition agreements where you can.
268
00:49:48.730 --> 00:49:55.619
Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: input requirements to the developer and
how it, you know, put protections into the development.
269
00:49:55.790 --> 00:49:57.919
Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: so that the city
```

00:49:58.320 --> 00:50:08.220

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: maintain some some safety in the process. If a developer goes well, I guess one of the crux is of E. Ifd, is that

271

00:50:08.430 --> 00:50:10.819

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: you're only spending money that you've created

272

00:50:10.980 --> 00:50:19.589

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: right? And so if the development doesn't materialize, then there's no money to get and no money sort of at risk.

273

00:50:19.960 --> 00:50:48.089

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: and that's the, I guess. Really the key point, in in addition to putting protections into Dda's for the most part, if it. If they default on it, then, like any other loan that's defaulted on someone else, becomes the owner. Is it the city that becomes the owner of the land, or is it the bank that becomes the owner of the land? It depends on where the you know the who owns the property at the be at the outset, and what sort of agreements are in place

274

00:50:48.350 --> 00:51:04.079

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: through the process of the ifp and the pfa those sorts of things, and all of those layers of protection are put in in place, so that you minimize the city's exposure and liability. If a developer does not see it all the way through

275

00:51:05.140 --> 00:51:13.880

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and have having having having worked with the city under redevelopment for many years. I should say that's a contact sport. And

276

00:51:13.940 --> 00:51:26.200

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: the city is quite rigorous in its protection of those funds, at least in my experience. although II won't say there are other cities that have not been

277

00:51:26.380 --> 00:51:34.029

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: as rigorous as Oakland around the State. But Oakland is certainly and rigorous in my experience.

278

00:51:35.220 --> 00:51:45.960

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: The I, there's a question of the city is protected. But how are the property owners paying the taxes protected?

279

00:51:46.340 --> 00:51:49.499

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And I understand that.

280

00:51:49.870 --> 00:52:00.250

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: My understanding of that question is, is, the taxpayers are paying the same thing one regardless. There's no additional amount

281

00:52:00.280 --> 00:52:07.709

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: that the taxpayers are paying under an E. If d. I accepted the taxes. Just continue as

282

00:52:08.140 --> 00:52:14.250

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: as always the protection. If what you mean taxpayers protected

283

00:52:14.480 --> 00:52:18.430

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: under the conversation we just had in terms of

284

00:52:18.530 --> 00:52:23.979

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: the developer going under. Again, there's a whole series of

285

00:52:24.260 --> 00:52:25.430

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: of

286

00:52:26.040 --> 00:52:29.690

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: regulatory agreements and deeds of trust and and monitoring

00:52:29.910 --> 00:52:35.460

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: that are layered on for that, and I'd be glad to talk further.

288

00:52:35.770 --> 00:52:39.250

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: offline about that.

289

00:52:39.780 --> 00:52:52.290

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and I'm sure the the city could talk further about it as we go through the process. There was a question about, how do we prioritize projects under the Eif?

290

00:52:52.460 --> 00:52:57.330

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: My understanding? Is that the process that you described.

291

00:52:57.350 --> 00:53:09.820

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: For setting up the Ifd establishes a prioritization for uses of the funds. Do you want to say more about that Erin or or council member.

292

00:53:10.700 --> 00:53:34.670

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: Sure. Ii will. The infrastructure, financing, plan details that out. And so, as you go through the development of it, and why I can take 12 months to 24 months, or even longer, is because one of those processes is the prioritization of all of the developments within the plan. What's going to get built first? What will be built last? What has priority in terms of bonding?

293

00:53:34.670 --> 00:53:58.780

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: What you know? Some things only make sense to be built first. You don't. You can't build the building and not have the water water lines. Yeah, build water lines or the streets before you build the buildings, or they have to be built together. So there's some things that go to that absolutely go together because of development cycle. But then, you know what's more meaningful to the community. Are we building the the grocery store? First, we building

294

00:53:58.780 --> 00:54:11.380

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: childcare centers next, or you know that

```
that is where the discussion lies in the Ifp. And what services?
Tangential developments go. In which order
295
00:54:14.010 --> 00:54:16.229
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: want to add
anything to that councilmember?
296
00:54:17.000 --> 00:54:18.090
Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: Exactly.
297
00:54:18.260 --> 00:54:25.249
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Okay, so yeah, it's
a robust community process. To
298
00:54:25.400 --> 00:54:28.370
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: to work this out.
299
00:54:28.620 --> 00:54:35.639
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: the overall. we
have lots of experience through
300
00:54:35.730 --> 00:54:46.050
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: the years under
redevelopment. And Lord knows there were mistakes made during
redevelopment and lessons learned. and
301
00:54:46.190 --> 00:54:49.589
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: I think this is a
possibility for doing it
302
00:54:49.860 --> 00:54:52.359
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: for doing it
differently.
303
00:54:52.480 --> 00:54:55.270
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: I think that the
big question.
304
00:54:55.400 --> 00:55:06.060
Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: that remains in the
```

process is this question of how to balance out the market rate pieces that make up for the taxes invested and the taxes invested.

305

00:55:06.410 --> 00:55:17.430

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: In community benefits that. Don't necessarily change the tax situation. However, I do want to point out that.

306

00:55:17.520 --> 00:55:22.189

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: It's a very interesting article in

307

00:55:22.460 --> 00:55:28.280

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: in Bloomberg, that came out about the city of Minneapolis.

308

00:55:28.340 --> 00:55:36.770

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: where the city of Minneapolis has invested heavily in affordable housing, and is now has the lowest inflation in the country.

309

00:55:36.890 --> 00:55:50.199

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And in part the low inflation for Minneapolis is being credited to their investment in affordable housing. So I think there are other benefits which I hope will be

310

00:55:50.510 --> 00:55:53.020

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: looked at during these discussions.

311

00:55:53.240 --> 00:55:55.149

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: And

312

00:55:55.300 --> 00:56:06.539

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: us sadly, we are getting towards the end of our time. But I wanna just leave a minute if a council member or or

313

00:56:06.960 --> 00:56:15.360

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: is it Director

Roseman. if either of you would like to make some final comments before we wrap up.

314

00:56:17.210 --> 00:56:23.889

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: I'll just say that now we don't have another option. But to

315

00:56:23.970 --> 00:56:42.300

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: really dive deep into how we engage these processes of housing and economic development. We're at a key point in our, in our existence, in the State of California about the futures that we want to create, and I am excited about the use of this tool. But

316

00:56:42.300 --> 00:56:56.669

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: the devil really is in the details. So I plan on being working in lock step with our city staff, with the mayor's office, and with all stakeholders at all levels of government, to make sure that we get this right, because

317

00:56:57.160 --> 00:57:00.510

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: really, only everything that we love is on the line

318

00:57:00.520 --> 00:57:11.070

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: shout out to Nina Turner, only everything that we love is on the line. So it's going to be important that we do our due diligence and making sure we educate the public

319

 $00:57:11.110 \longrightarrow 00:57:19.950$

Councilmember Caroll Fife / City of Oakland: and ourselves, myself included around those details. And I'm just looking forward to what we what we can create when we get it right.

320

00:57:21.630 --> 00:57:23.650

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Thank you so much.

321

00:57:24.020 --> 00:57:27.499

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: Director Roseman any final comments.

00:57:28.120 --> 00:57:36.139

Erin Roseman/City of Oakland: I concur with Councilmember 5. It is definitely the long day. And the devil is in the details

323

00:57:36.270 --> 00:57:41.270

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: exactly in the next day or 2

324

00:57:41.300 --> 00:57:58.089

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: spur will be sending out an email to all of you with a link to today's recording and other resources that our panelists would like to share. Which I hope will include director Rosman's terrific presentation.

325

00:57:58.220 --> 00:58:03.130

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: I wanna thank everybody for coming today

326

00:58:03.150 --> 00:58:09.670

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and for opening up this conversation. I'm hopeful that this is the beginning of a conversation.

327

00:58:10.050 --> 00:58:30.859

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: and I think there's a lot of potential here, one way or the other, we have to address housing issues. And I think there's opportunities using this and other tax tools to find ways to invest back in our cities at this critical time.

328

00:58:30.900 --> 00:58:37.470

Joshua Simon / Community Arts Stabilization Trust: So thank you very much for joining us today. And with that I bid you all to do.