WEBVTT

1
00:00:46.560 --> 00:00:49.540
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: Good afternoon. Everyone. I think

2
00:00:49.680 --> 00:00:54.560
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: there is going to be a few a minute or so of everyone filtering into the room.

3
00:00:54.770 --> 00:00:57.260
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: But we're gonna go ahead and get started.

4
00:00:58.040 --> 00:01:02.820
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: My name is Jonathan Cass. I'm. A transportation policy manager at Spur.

5
00:01:03.320 --> 00:01:07.020
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: Thank you so much for joining us for today's digital. This course.

6
00:01:07.090 --> 00:01:11.690
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: Many of you here today are spur members, so thank you for your support.

7
00:01:12.120 --> 00:01:20.230
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: If you're not a member, I encourage you to join to support first ongoing work and using education, policy, analysis, and advocacy

8
00:01:20.420 --> 00:01:25.900
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: to make our cities and region more prosperous, sustainable, and equitable places to live.

9
00:01:26.580 --> 00:01:31.639
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: Your financial support enables us to continue our work, including hosting programs like today's

10
00:01:31.660 --> 00:01:34.800
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: you'll find more information about membership online

11
00:01:34.920 --> 00:01:38.499
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: at spur.org slash, join.

12
00:01:39.920 --> 00:01:48.910
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: and a quick. If artist meant. Our next digital discourse is scheduled for this Wednesday, February First, at 1230 Pm.

13
00:01:48.950 --> 00:01:54.550
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: It is titled the Future of Urbanism, the shared Prosperity Partnership

14
00:01:55.380 --> 00:02:05.480
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: the strength of American cities, and the nation as a whole depends on generating inclusive growth for people of all races, ethnicities, and incomes.

15
00:02:05.530 --> 00:02:09.159
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: Yet even in our most economically vibrant cities.

16
00:02:09.440 --> 00:02:15.719
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: Not all residents benefit from that growth resulting in stark, racial, and economic disparities

17
00:02:15.800 --> 00:02:18.670
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: that are even more extreme in distressed communities

18
00:02:18.750 --> 00:02:24.679
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: join us for a virtual dialogue with Spurs President and CEO, Alicia, John Baptiste.

19
00:02:25.040 --> 00:02:30.929
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: and with Jennifer Bradley, senior Fellow for American cities at the Kresky foundation

20
00:02:31.440 --> 00:02:36.679
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: in which they'll discuss the progress of the shared prosperity partnership.

21

00:02:36.990 --> 00:02:40.490
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: and how this work is informing the future of urbanism.

22
00:02:42.460 --> 00:02:48.039
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: And now onto today's forum which will deal with road pricing.

23
00:02:48.590 --> 00:02:54.130
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: This is a policy area in which Spur has been engaged for years most recently

24
00:02:54.330 --> 00:03:03.409
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: for recommended action on road pricing as part of our as part of our 2,070 regional strategy project.

25
00:03:03.730 --> 00:03:10.020
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: particularly in our report titled value-driven, which I can drop in the link for your future

26
00:03:10.510 --> 00:03:19.740
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: spurses. Pricing deployed correctly as an essential tool to achieve equity, sustainability, and mobility goals.

27
00:03:20.160 --> 00:03:27.999
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: So we're thrilled to hear from today's panel experts in this moment of thoughtful momentum on this topic.

28
00:03:28.650 --> 00:03:37.069
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: and to properly introduce and guide us through today's digital discourse. I'd like to I. I'll pass the mic to Stewart Cohen

29
00:03:37.440 --> 00:03:46.149
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: Stewart is the principal at sc strategies providing strategic guidance around equity, transportation, and equitable development

30
00:03:46.330 --> 00:03:50.819
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: to the public, to the public sector, nonprofits and foundations across the country.

31
00:03:51.170 --> 00:03:56.849
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: and until March 2019 stewards served as the founding executive director of Transform.

32
00:03:56.960 --> 00:03:59.630
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: California is leading transportation. Nonprofit

33
00:04:00.140 --> 00:04:04.380
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: He co-authored the report pricing roads, advancing equity

34
00:04:04.580 --> 00:04:10.650
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: which has helped guide pricing studies in Seattle, Los Angeles, and other regions.

35
00:04:11.100 --> 00:04:20.010
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: Among his many roles, Stewart's been serving as senior policy adviser to spur, and we're pleased to have him as an advisor on our pricing research and engagement.

36
00:04:20.649 --> 00:04:23.250
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: So with that, Stewart, i'll pass it to you.

37
00:04:23.620 --> 00:04:31.100
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Thank you so much, Jonathan, and very excited, for today's discourse on is the price, right?

38
00:04:31.190 --> 00:04:40.449
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Exploring solutions for freeway congestion. And I think folks know whether you're driving alone or riding a bus or in a car pool.

39
00:04:40.540 --> 00:04:45.500
Stuart Cohen (he/him): The Bay area is freeways are really congested, and they're gonna get worse.

40
00:04:45.600 --> 00:04:51.880

Stuart Cohen (he/him): We know that widening roads isn't sustainable, whether it's environmentally or financially.

41
00:04:52.010 --> 00:04:55.860
Stuart Cohen (he/him): And that's why the region is now exploring a user fee

42
00:04:55.930 --> 00:05:02.409
Stuart Cohen (he/him): for driving on our congested freeways, especially in corridors with good public transportation.

43
00:05:03.080 --> 00:05:21.430
Stuart Cohen (he/him): And this discourse we're gonna hear about pricing studies in San Francisco. We're also kind of the main folks is going to be Mtc's next generation Bay area freeway study, which is ongoing right now, and this really may set a new trajectory for the region.

44
00:05:21.480 --> 00:05:26.899
Stuart Cohen (he/him): We're gonna dive into key questions about the study like.

45
00:05:27.000 --> 00:05:32.890
Stuart Cohen (he/him): What are the main options for tolling? And what are the options for investing the money

46
00:05:33.030 --> 00:05:51.560
Stuart Cohen (he/him): to me most critically, you know, Can we price roads in a way that actually advances social and racial equity, because, as we know, inequities are only growing in our region, and and we've got to tackle that issue head on. So we've got a perfect line up

47
00:05:51.570 --> 00:06:06.810
Stuart Cohen (he/him): a road pricing leaders with us here today to explore this topic. The speakers today are first, a a new to Passe, who is a principal transportation planner in the long range

48
00:06:06.820 --> 00:06:20.870
Stuart Cohen (he/him): planning team at Mtc. He's the project manager for this next generation Bayer freeway study and he's committed to collaborative approaches and enabling equitable transportation outcomes.

49
00:06:21.080 --> 00:06:40.299
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Rachel Hyatt is the Assistant Deputy Director for planning at the Sf. County transportation authority known as Cta Rachel Leads Transportation planning for Treasurer Island and also manages the downtown congestion pricing study, as well as agencies, work on mobility as a service

50
00:06:40.310 --> 00:06:43.310
Stuart Cohen (he/him): and innovative travel demand management.

51
00:06:43.670 --> 00:06:55.509
Stuart Cohen (he/him): And then, finally, we've got Asha Weinstein Aguwal, who works at San Jose State University, where she's Director of Manetta Transportation Institute National Transportation Finance Center.

52
00:06:55.650 --> 00:07:13.749
Stuart Cohen (he/him): She's also Professor of Urban and Regional planning and directs an online graduate program and transportation management. And the way we're going to run this is first. We're going to have Rachel discuss what's happening in San Francisco. Some of their pricing work has

53
00:07:14.110 --> 00:07:33.790
Stuart Cohen (he/him): really pushed the envelope on equity, and we we want to be able to learn from that, and then we'll pass it over to our new for the primary presentation. And then Asha will be able to, you know, reflect and comment on these before we dive into questions, and we really looking forward

54
00:07:33.800 --> 00:07:39.950
Stuart Cohen (he/him): to an interactive conversation with you all. So with that, Why, Don't, I hand it over to you, Rachel.

55
00:07:41.540 --> 00:07:48.750
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: Thank you. And thank you for everyone's interest in this topic. It's one that Sfcta has

56
00:07:48.760 --> 00:08:05.709
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: done work on for a over a decade, and in a few different ways. You know we've thought about pricing, and you know how to make pricing equitable, and, in fact, advance equity through pricing

57
00:08:05.770 --> 00:08:16.279
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: just for folks who may not be familiar with Sfca. We are the county transportation authority. So we prepare the long-range plan

58
00:08:16.660 --> 00:08:30.100
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: for San Francisco that looks at all modes, all operators over a multi-decade horizon, and asks, how do we meet our goals? And it's really in that role that we've

59
00:08:30.780 --> 00:08:50.480
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: identified the need for pricing as a tool in our toolbox so most recently. Our Board adopted the San Francisco Transportation Plan, which is this long range county wide plan, and it does identify demand management in a few forms so managing our freeways through manage lanes and express bus

60
00:08:50.490 --> 00:08:59.529
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: and using a cordon style congestion pricing. There's also the Treasure Island mobility program, which is another role we have

61
00:08:59.960 --> 00:09:09.949
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: to support the implementation of the new transportation system that will serve redeveloped Treasure Island.

62
00:09:09.960 --> 00:09:22.979
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: and that, in addition to you, the new transit and other multimodal services has a congestion to to manage congestion and fund the transit, and that also has an equity program.

63
00:09:24.280 --> 00:09:35.020
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: One of the most recent efforts in cordon style. Congestion pricing at Sf. Cta has been our downtown

64
00:09:36.340 --> 00:09:53.250
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: congestion management congestion pricing study downtown congestion pricing study and this was initiated requested by our board pre-pandemic. So back in the 2,018 2,019 period, when congestion was at record levels for us

65

00:09:53.350 --> 00:10:12.349
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: downtown, we started this study. Equity was already a core focus of that study, both in the process that we set up to develop the the study findings as well as in the outcomes that we wanted to achieve through pricing, and

66
00:10:12.630 --> 00:10:28.250
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: the study is on pause. Now it's been on pause for for a bit. Actually, as we just try to get a better handle on how traffic patterns will emerge, and how travel and congestion will

67
00:10:28.260 --> 00:10:33.340
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: emerge, following the pandemic. There's still so much changing.

68
00:10:33.730 --> 00:10:43.350
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: So the studies on pause. But we did make a lot of progress when it it was underway, and one of the things that we

69
00:10:43.510 --> 00:10:46.480
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: did on equity front is work with

70
00:10:46.670 --> 00:11:06.580
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: community-based organizations, we set up a policy advisory committee that was most the majority of representatives on that committee were those representing our equity priority communities so that that was one way. And then we also had a separate

71
00:11:06.590 --> 00:11:17.930
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: co-creation outreach process where we worked with community members themselves through community based organizations to help define

72
00:11:17.940 --> 00:11:37.219
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: a lot of the key decision points in the study. Starting with, you know. What are the goals and what are the performance metrics? And so equity was a a big part of that, so a key goal, as well as having metrics to assess whether the congestion pricing scenarios would meet that goal. One of the

73
00:11:37.900 --> 00:11:56.930

Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: definitions of equity that are Community Advisory Committee, as well as you know, the participants in our outreach process identified to measure equity is how low income and very low income. Households, expenses might change their costs of transportation

74
00:11:56.960 --> 00:12:03.789
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: and their cost of trip making. How would that change with congestion pricing? So that is one of the metrics that

75
00:12:04.340 --> 00:12:22.520
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: we looked at with each congestion Pricing scenario we developed with the sort of the threshold we wanted to meet was to have no increases in transportation expenses for low and very low income travelers. One of the few of the different, you know

76
00:12:22.530 --> 00:12:24.970
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: ways that we identified to do that

77
00:12:25.120 --> 00:12:31.810
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: one, you know, is the I think, the obvious, how we reinvest revenues, to make

78
00:12:31.820 --> 00:12:46.629
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: sure that transit and other ways of traveling are disproportionately benefit our equity, priority communities, and improve access for neighborhoods that have relatively poor access today, but also a means based

79
00:12:46.930 --> 00:12:50.539
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: fee structure for the congestion pricing fee itself.

80
00:12:50.570 --> 00:12:54.920
And that's something that we had found was very important in meeting that

81
00:12:55.020 --> 00:13:08.069
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: expenses metric. And so what that ended up looking like over the course of this study to the point that we've reached was a graduated means based fee structure.

82
00:13:08.330 --> 00:13:10.670
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: where it was only the

83
00:13:10.940 --> 00:13:18.799
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: 2 highest income quintiles of folks in the bay area who would pay sort of the full fee.

84
00:13:19.080 --> 00:13:26.170
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: And so 60% of the population, or you know, the 3 lowest income

85
00:13:26.480 --> 00:13:33.330
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: it income. Quintiles of folks would have some sort of discount or exemption.

86
00:13:33.340 --> 00:13:50.959
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: and in a number of many of our scenarios, actually we've we ended up exempting completely the lowest income traveler, so very low income, quintile of folks, and then the discount to the fee was steeper

87
00:13:51.020 --> 00:13:59.919
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: for lower income, and then there was a discount for moderate income, Middle, you know the the folks who are between

88
00:14:00.340 --> 00:14:13.819
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: 40 and 60% of area Median income. We've also used that approach in the the recommendations. So far for the Treasure Island congestion toll program

89
00:14:13.830 --> 00:14:25.460
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: mit Ctl, and that program is also still under development. There have been the Board Treasure Island Mobility Management Agency Board has adopted a couple of different elements of an affordability program 150

90
00:14:25.720 --> 00:14:43.319
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: that go beyond the fee. What the a fee structure would be. The fee structure is not adopted at this point, and those include subsidies for businesses and low income workers, and a transit pass, a deeply discounted transit pass.

91
00:14:43.330 --> 00:14:47.899
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: and the fee structures that have been drafted and

92
00:14:48.270 --> 00:14:56.450
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: presented. So far all include this mean space fee structure which would fully exempt the lowest income quintile.

93
00:14:56.810 --> 00:15:16.829
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: So those are some of the things that we've learned so far our study, the downtown congestion pricing study is on pause. But we will, you know, Monitor, and we do monitor congestion, and how that emerges it to an understand future need for a tool like this. It is something that in our long range

94
00:15:16.840 --> 00:15:17.780
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: plan

95
00:15:18.120 --> 00:15:35.719
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: we've identified that we may eventually need to reach our long term goals for greenhouse gas emissions and congestion management, and and and our other are their goals vision 0. You can find those information about where we got to date

96
00:15:35.730 --> 00:15:40.199
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: at S. F. cta.org slash downtown.

97
00:15:41.070 --> 00:15:43.270
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: So thank you for having me today.

98
00:15:44.410 --> 00:15:49.250
Stuart Cohen (he/him): That's great, Rachel. Thank you and new if you'd like to share your screen. Now.

99
00:15:49.310 --> 00:15:50.919
Stuart Cohen (he/him): I look forward to your presentation.

100
00:15:51.970 --> 00:15:56.319
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Yeah, thanks, Rachel, and, thanks to word. Good afternoon, everyone.

101

00:15:56.410 --> 00:16:00.969
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): It's nice to be here today and again. Thank you for your interest in this topic.

102
00:16:01.080 --> 00:16:07.729
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): I probably don't need to go over the problems we face or expect to face on our freeways with this group. I know it's a

103
00:16:07.980 --> 00:16:14.899
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): pretty solutions oriented group that i'm talking to. So i'm going to cut to the chase and not talk about why we are exploring freeway pricing strategies, but

104
00:16:14.930 --> 00:16:29.280
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): how we're exploring it at most point Public firms. We do need to spend time talking about why we're exploring. So this is about the next generation freeway study, exploring, pricing strategies to advance equity, climate, and mobility goals. So

105
00:16:29.600 --> 00:16:35.780
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): we many of you probably agree that pricing strategies may offer potential to transform our freeways.

106
00:16:35.860 --> 00:16:49.350
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): But the more critical question is whether there is an equitable and politically acceptable pathway towards doing so. And so for that we need to think about who might be disproportionately impacted by this. And who's actually sitting in those cars, those bands, those trucks.

107
00:16:49.360 --> 00:16:58.090
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): people with low incomes, who will disproportionately feel impact of any additional costs, or people with not so low incomes who are still feeling the burden of an affordability in our region.

108
00:16:58.120 --> 00:17:15.270
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): The early wage workers who work multiple jobs and use the freeways more frequently, or the super commuters who have been pushed out of the region due to lack of affordable housing or working parents who must use the freeway, doing school hours or farm owners that travel long distances or small business owners

109

00:17:15.280 --> 00:17:26.529
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): like plumbers and construction workers who may need to use that freeway multiple times. All these constituents are things we need to think about as we move forward in this study, and so

110
00:17:26.829 --> 00:17:31.820
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): pricing strategies on their own cannot be studied in isolation. What we are studying in this.

111
00:17:31.930 --> 00:17:41.959
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): you know. The study is exploring pathways that combine pricing and complementary strategies. So the pricing strategy is about the where and how much and the when

112
00:17:41.970 --> 00:17:59.400
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): of the pricing and pricing strategies can only help solve so much, but also create new problems and so complementary strategies funded by tolling revenues or alignment of existing or planned revenues must work hand in hand with pricing to enable that

113
00:17:59.410 --> 00:18:02.750
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): equitable and politically acceptable pathway.

114
00:18:02.920 --> 00:18:17.069
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): So that brings me to the study which is really an early implementation of the freeway Pricing strategy in Plan Bayer 2050, a plan that you may be familiar with it's a package of 35 strategies that lays out a blueprint for growth in our region.

115
00:18:17.080 --> 00:18:36.650
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): and the plan contains a specific strategy to price freeways, and this was adopted by our elected officials in 2,021. This strategy was critical in meeting our State mandated emissions, targets, and also managing congestion and the travel times that we forecast to grow in the absence of bold actions in the coming years.

116
00:18:36.960 --> 00:18:56.680
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): The study, the next and freeway study specifically, is an early implementation action of what can be a long road ahead, including future efforts on corridor scale, studies, other planning studies, framing a pilot, and eventually, maybe i'm thinking about a pilot, but bringing the focus back to this study. It is about a 2 year study.

117
00:18:56.690 --> 00:19:04.639
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): We are around the midpoint now. We completed our first round of community engagement last fall last summer.

118
00:19:04.880 --> 00:19:11.409
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): and we have been closely engaging with a diverse 18 person advisory group, some of which are on the span of today.

119
00:19:11.830 --> 00:19:24.329
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And so over the last 6 months in phase 2. We have been talking about goals for next generation freeway, and taking the first tab at at drawing on what these pathways could be, combining, pricing and complementary strategies.

120
00:19:24.350 --> 00:19:34.379
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And just so, you know, of coming in Phase 3, we're going to be spending time analyzing these pathways with technical analysis and another round of community engagement.

121
00:19:35.180 --> 00:19:46.459
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): So there are several questions that the study must tackle right. What does this mean for HIV? And expressly, what do the revenues be used. For if we offer too many exemptions and discounts, does that reduce the effectiveness of pricing?

122
00:19:46.470 --> 00:19:59.119
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): What is the cost of implementation of all this? And will drivers pay multiple fees with the fee in downtown San Francisco and Bridgetals, and so there's many questions that the study must tackle, and we've already been tackling some of these.

123
00:19:59.420 --> 00:20:10.849
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): but to ground us. I do want to highlight what we heard during the community engagement last summer. There is very clear frustration with both on affordability and traffic in the region.

124
00:20:10.860 --> 00:20:26.649
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Most folks want the same things, less congestion, free ways that hold more capacity save freeway, safe drivers. Everyone communicated that less time in traffic means something. It means more time for family, less stress, more economic opportunities.

125
00:20:26.790 --> 00:20:43.490
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): But then, what is that? Came at a price, and not surprisingly. All the first reactions to pricing were very harsh. We already pay for this double taxation. This sounds like another money grab. There's deep distrust in policymakers. And how pricing could actually work. And those revenue is put to something. Good

126
00:20:43.500 --> 00:20:47.309
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): People want to see proof that something like this can actually work.

127
00:20:48.330 --> 00:21:01.970
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And so we need a common starting point. Then what can we all agree on with this idea of next generation freeways? So with the advisory group we landed, set on a 5 of 5 goals, and this, echoed the community feedback that we heard.

128
00:21:01.980 --> 00:21:13.760
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And it's so important to get this right. But we are fully aware that not everyone is going to feel equally good about all these 5 goals, and we have already been seeing that through polls we have had doing some public webinars.

129
00:21:14.110 --> 00:21:34.099
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): There's broad agreement on these 5 goals, but some goals receive more support than others, like efficient and safe, are definitely the 2 goals that receive the highest support. But others, like reparative or affordable, have mixed feelings of how people want to achieve those goals. And so future discussion on how pathway is advanced all these 5 goals.

130
00:21:34.110 --> 00:21:42.069
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): We'll be very critical on the progress we're making towards each goals, and which which goals. We want to make more progress on versus less.

131
00:21:43.570 --> 00:21:57.680
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): So the focus for the last few months in this study has been co-creating this initial set of regional scale pathways that we want to analyze and phase 3 of our studies. So if we are here at the bottom today and want

132
00:21:57.690 --> 00:22:03.580
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): next generation free ways with those goals 15 and 20 years ahead. What are the different pathways to get there?

133
00:22:03.880 --> 00:22:23.509
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And so the pathway is first explore pricing strategies. And so we are landing on 3 pricing strategies. And also this option of no new pricing initiatives. The first pricing strategy is to toll all in so far free ways where there is existing or planned frequent, and, I may say, frequent. It's at least about a 10 min headway.

134
00:22:23.520 --> 00:22:26.139
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): express, bus or rail service.

135
00:22:26.410 --> 00:22:40.269
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): The second is a variation also tolling highways, all of of highways, but also parallel arterials to limit diversion onto them; and the third is tolling vehicles entering the downtown and the 3 largest cities.

136
00:22:40.280 --> 00:22:52.980
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And so I want to emphasize here that before we all enter panic mode, that this is really an early stage, long-term, study, and we are just getting the conversation started on pricing and not seeking to implement any of this in the near term.

137
00:22:54.170 --> 00:23:13.660
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Now, along with the comp pricing strategies, what complementary strategies should be part of those pathways, and there are many options, but we cannot invest in it all. There are trade offs, so can we make significant improvements to transit by having 10 min headways where they work best, or introduce new at best service, or invest in safety to convert those choice riders

138
00:23:13.670 --> 00:23:18.709
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): or expense service hours to cater to those who are working multiple job ships.

139
00:23:18.850 --> 00:23:39.029
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): or there are large parts of population that will not have public transit options, either because they've been pushed away from the region, or because they need to drive the tools and cleaning products in their car. So what share of tolling revenues might you want to put forward towards cost offsets like toll discounts for specific population groups or toll caps for drivers that drive a lot.

140

00:23:39.630 --> 00:23:54.849
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Then do we want to also improve local local streets. So people feel safer accessing transit or bicycling to avoid the short trips on the freeways? Or do we want to put additional funding to our pavement mentioned, and some drivers feel that they are getting their work from their tolls.

141
00:23:55.270 --> 00:24:09.349
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And then, finally, are we only going to keep talking about equity, or are we going to put money where our mouth is, and acknowledged that freeways have caused harm and disinvestment in so many communities, and use tolling revenues to redress past harms and improve

142
00:24:09.360 --> 00:24:16.350
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): highway pedestrian crossing, or or create more greening in those 3 wayages and communities, or think about noise mitigation.

143
00:24:16.460 --> 00:24:23.989
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Now I know our ideal answer is all of the above. But we simply cannot do that, especially if there aren't new revenue sources.

144
00:24:24.960 --> 00:24:27.469
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And so we designed a game one that will

145
00:24:27.540 --> 00:24:44.669
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): let people away the trade offs of different strategies. Given a fiscal constraint and decide which strategy should be part of the pathway. And so what you see up there on the slide is the game board. We're in small teams. Members of our advisory group had a starting set of tokens given to them

146
00:24:44.680 --> 00:24:56.219
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): that was based on a feature potential regional transportation measure as well as what pricing strategy you want to work with. And then they all have to collectively agree on what complementary strategies they wanted to invest, to still consume.

147
00:24:57.960 --> 00:25:12.459
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): and all teams invested their tokens in a core set of strategies demonstrating a clear like transit, first priority. And so so we thought that all pricing pathway is invested at least about 40% of revenues, and making transit more reliable and accessible. And so that means

148
00:25:12.470 --> 00:25:22.689
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): trunk plan, transit frequency boost as 10 min headways, not only on rail, but also express buses on freeways, and those major bus lines that run on the major arterials that parallel freeways.

149
00:25:22.930 --> 00:25:33.649
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): a better network of interconnected bus on the lanes, and then local street improvements to improve access to transit. So all that took up already about 40% of revenues.

150
00:25:34.230 --> 00:25:49.819
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And so then, with that starting point of the pricing strategies and these transit first strategies, we wanted to develop a draft of what is the portfolio of pathways that we want to analyze in the next few months. And so we wanted to create divergent approaches, so we can understand

151
00:25:49.830 --> 00:26:06.030
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): impacts of different ways of investment. So what you see here is a little bit of a matrix where you have the 3 pricing strategies on the left, and 2 versions of the way we invest the funding, coming from a potential regional measure and tolling revenues. And so that's 6 pathways

152
00:26:06.040 --> 00:26:19.499
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): in addition to. And in addition, there's a no pricing pathway. But we still want to see if there's a viable future where that can also advance those goals we talked about when there's no pricing.

153
00:26:19.890 --> 00:26:25.389
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And so each of these pathways have the transit first focus, but then they have a

154
00:26:25.480 --> 00:26:39.789
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): separate focus one. That is the a version that invests in doubling down in transit, and another version that responds more to our community feedback on on affordability in the region, and how we can focus more of the revenues

155
00:26:39.800 --> 00:26:47.509

Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): towards, say, toll discounts, or other measures to improve, to help address the increase in costs.

156
00:26:47.800 --> 00:26:51.149
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): So these are divergent approaches that we want to study, and

157
00:26:51.220 --> 00:26:56.800
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): and hopefully we have interesting findings to share down the line. So just

158
00:26:57.240 --> 00:27:07.380
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): some next steps. We are going to analyze this through our transportation models that we have in House come spring time or late spring.

159
00:27:07.390 --> 00:27:19.710
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): We want to start sharing findings, and that's when we'll have some interesting findings, and what might be some revenue forecast. What are we seeing in changes in our performance in mode, shift, or an affordability

160
00:27:19.720 --> 00:27:30.910
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): relative to those goals we I showed you previously. And what outcomes are we seeing by corridors, too, Are there's different responses to the change in number of trips or Vmt. Or affordability by corridor.

161
00:27:31.040 --> 00:27:35.210
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And then, when those findings, we hope to have

162
00:27:35.390 --> 00:27:48.529
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): some interesting materials to share in the summer with the wider public. Perhaps back in this group on on what we are seeing are the effects of pricing on our freeways, at least, as we can learn from our analysis.

163
00:27:49.420 --> 00:27:52.109
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): So with that i'll turn it back to you, Stewart. Thank you

164
00:27:53.010 --> 00:28:10.059

Stuart Cohen (he/him): all right. That was great and a a speedy but really comprehensive overview. And now to back clean up. We've got Asha and Asha love to hear your thoughts on these studies and on kind of how we do pricing.

165
00:28:10.900 --> 00:28:23.400
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: Well, thank you so much. Spur for including me in this this program. It's something I've been thinking about for over 20 years, I might add, together with Rachel Hyatt. I think we did our first pricing study together in grad school.

166
00:28:25.670 --> 00:28:32.550
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: One thing i'd like to to bring up is something that Rachel did allude to earlier, which is this question of rates.

167
00:28:32.650 --> 00:28:33.990
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: So

168
00:28:34.060 --> 00:28:46.700
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: I think you know, when we first think of Well, if we add pricing that people are not currently paying, you know, sort of any additional cost for very low income people is a burden.

169
00:28:46.760 --> 00:28:53.310
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: But there are definitely ways to structure the rates that first of all

170
00:28:53.420 --> 00:29:02.199
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: might eliminate that burden, or potentially even, could give us a more progressive funding situation than we have now.

171
00:29:02.270 --> 00:29:17.009
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: So i'll give a couple of examples one again, Rachel already mentioned, which is. Well, maybe we have a lower rate for low income drivers, and I've actually done for 13 years now a national survey every year, asking people in this case if they would support

172
00:29:17.020 --> 00:29:36.719
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: a mileage fee at the Federal level. And one of our questions for several years has been, If Congress adopts the mileage fee would you support or oppose charging

a lower rate to low income drivers, and this year we found 59% of people said that they would indeed support that lower rate for low income.

173
00:29:36.730 --> 00:29:37.650
Some drivers.

174
00:29:38.090 --> 00:29:52.819
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: Another idea, though, when it comes to rate setting, is to think about something that we could borrow from the other utilities like electric and water pricing, which is what gets called a block rate pricing structure.

175
00:29:52.840 --> 00:29:56.570
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: So the idea here is that everybody

176
00:29:57.170 --> 00:30:16.100
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: pays, you know, a relatively low per mile, or whatever the rate is set at for some initial amount of travel. And then, after that, the rate rises. So, for example, and i'm just pulling numbers out of a hat here, you know. If it were, you know, maybe for the first

177
00:30:16.620 --> 00:30:30.849
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: I don't know 1,000 miles. You drive on tollings in the Bay area in a year, or something like that. You pay, you know, X dollars per mile or cents per mile, and then for any additional miles you pay more per mile.

178
00:30:30.860 --> 00:30:47.000
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: And one reason that it's important that this can actually create improved equity is that there is is essentially endless evidence that very low income people do not drive as many miles a year as high income people.

179
00:30:47.010 --> 00:30:58.760
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: and there are lots of reasons for this. And again, this is, on average, they're always going to be exceptions. But you know, if you're very low income, you can't afford to be driving extremely long distances.

180
00:30:58.790 --> 00:31:00.840
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: and so

181

00:31:01.330 --> 00:31:29.009
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: we we can sort of use that to our advantage in the way we structure these rates. And just to and i'm gonna wrap up, I know, in a second here. But one other thing i'll mention is I I've done another study recently where we were looking at all of California, and we were interested in. What are the differences in the kinds of vehicles people drive, depending on their income level. And also you know how many miles are they driving things like that.

182
00:31:29.170 --> 00:31:48.979
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: And we found, for example, that there is indeed a big difference in how many miles Anarchist weekly people were driving. So we found that, For example, statewide, the highest in income. Households are driving 61% more than the lowest income household.

183
00:31:48.990 --> 00:32:08.159
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: At the same time fuel efficiency by income is not as big as maybe people sometimes imagine. We found that in urban areas i'll give us that right now. The urban vehicles Sorry the highest income vehicles and this is statewide, or about 8% more efficient than the vehicle is driven by the lowest income

184
00:32:08.170 --> 00:32:09.110
households.

185
00:32:09.140 --> 00:32:12.860
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: So I know I've kind of run on. Let me just pause there.

186
00:32:15.750 --> 00:32:18.469
Stuart Cohen (he/him): No, that wasn't running on that was

187
00:32:19.500 --> 00:32:27.179
Stuart Cohen (he/him): that was really good. And let me follow up with a a question to you, Asha.

188
00:32:27.600 --> 00:32:28.300
Stuart Cohen (he/him): You know

189
00:32:28.480 --> 00:32:32.379
Stuart Cohen (he/him): what rate structures could help

190
00:32:32.760 --> 00:32:35.029
Stuart Cohen (he/him): to achieve equitable outcomes

191
00:32:35.510 --> 00:32:38.830
Stuart Cohen (he/him): while making sure. I mean you went over this a little bit, but that

192
00:32:39.170 --> 00:32:45.730
Stuart Cohen (he/him): that we're still really getting efficiency on the roadway right? Because at some point.

193
00:32:46.190 --> 00:32:51.879
Stuart Cohen (he/him): if you have so many discounts, the whole concept of kind of reducing demand.

194
00:32:51.950 --> 00:32:55.829
Stuart Cohen (he/him): especially for the most price sensitive can go away. So how do we balance these?

195
00:32:56.000 --> 00:33:10.830
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: Right? Well, thank you for giving me a chance to go all professory for a moment and then explain basic concepts here. So the idea of pricing, and particularly if we think of it as in congestion pricing where maybe the pricing is focused on the most congested

196
00:33:10.840 --> 00:33:17.000
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: concepts is, and let's just use a You know a concert.

197
00:33:17.400 --> 00:33:22.110
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: It's it's, you know it's it's, you know it's it's. You know it's it's, you know it's it's it's it's it's it's you know it's, it's it's, you know it's it's you know it's it's you know it's, it's, you know it's it's it's, you know it's it's, you know it's it's it's, you know it's, it's, you know it's it's it's you know it's it's you know it's it's. You know it's it's you know it's, you know it's it's you know it's, you know it's it's you know it's it's you know it's it'

198
00:33:22.410 --> 00:33:39.600

Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: far more people are going to show up than can fit in the stadium, and if you charge, you know a 1,000 10,000dollars a ticket, you're gonna have a lot of empty seats, I'm assuming, and so we can use the price to essentially

199
00:33:39.610 --> 00:33:46.670
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: influence. How many people show up for the concert or in our transportation case, how many people show up wanting to drive.

200
00:33:46.960 --> 00:33:51.000
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: And if you get the prices right.

201
00:33:51.170 --> 00:33:57.830
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: everybody who's driving gets the benefit of, you know, congestion-free or maybe congestion light trip.

202
00:33:58.050 --> 00:34:04.699
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: But if you set the prices such that the same number of people who currently want to drive.

203
00:34:04.790 --> 00:34:24.360
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: you know, essentially still can or want to. They can still show up for the concert. They're still going to show up, you know, to drive, and so we could end up with a situation actually where we are charging people money. Some, you know, some drivers are maybe paying a lot, and yet we're not getting those benefits we're raising revenue which could be valuable for improving transit

204
00:34:24.370 --> 00:34:40.329
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: by safety or anything else but the drivers are who are still there. Aren't getting that benefit of reliable, you know speedy travel. So, as we think about, you know, ways to make an equitable pricing system.

205
00:34:40.340 --> 00:34:44.459
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: it's really important to to realize that we do

206
00:34:44.550 --> 00:34:46.040
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: have to

207

00:34:46.350 --> 00:35:06.110
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: to encourage some people to find other travel options, and that doesn't mean to be a large fraction of the people. There are lots of traffic engineering graphs in schools that will show that, you know. Maybe 5% of people stop driving on a congested freeway, and that can be enough to kind of

208
00:35:06.120 --> 00:35:10.430
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: take you back to, you know, relatively reliable, free, flowing traffic.

209
00:35:12.220 --> 00:35:13.290
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Yeah, Great.

210
00:35:14.740 --> 00:35:20.739
Stuart Cohen (he/him): So thank you for that. Let me just throw one over to an loop, and then.

211
00:35:20.880 --> 00:35:29.740
Stuart Cohen (he/him): folks, you know. We have some questions coming in. That would be a great time to put the questions in in the quest. Q. A. Box there.

212
00:35:29.790 --> 00:35:48.520
Stuart Cohen (he/him): and and we will get to those really soon. So a new one of the things that you know continues to happen in our region as housing prices continue to escalate is that there is a displacement of low income and communities of color to places that are far from jobs.

213
00:35:48.780 --> 00:35:51.589
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Increasingly, you know, with few transit choices.

214
00:35:51.870 --> 00:36:02.440
Stuart Cohen (he/him): and so kind of what are some of the things that are happening in the study that you know might both analyze this and then be able to help mitigate for this issue.

215
00:36:04.690 --> 00:36:07.869
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Yeah, Stewart, thanks for that question. So

216
00:36:08.040 --> 00:36:17.640

Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): it is true that there are many households that are pushed towards away from the urban core, who will probably never be well served by transit.

217
00:36:17.810 --> 00:36:22.320
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): So then, if they are not going to be well served by transit

218
00:36:23.090 --> 00:36:41.659
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): part of the solution, maybe land use which we are not exactly covering in the context of this study. The other part of the solution is, how can driving be better for them right, and so that can come from removing more cars from the free ways that they are using. And so that may

219
00:36:41.670 --> 00:36:59.269
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): be, these people who are living closer to the urban core, have different options to take it, but they are not yet taking it, because it's somewhat of a. There's not enough of a stick to move to transit. I i'm not just a stick. There's not even a a good transit option even for them. So it's.

220
00:36:59.280 --> 00:37:14.910
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): How do we take those toll revenues and make and improve our transit options. So those drivers shift off cars, and then, second, like ratio, also mentioned thinking about like what is an appropriate means based

221
00:37:14.990 --> 00:37:29.280
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): affordability strategies that we can use, whether it's like toll caps for this most frequent drivers or those that rely on vehicles all the time and do not have an option to take transit. So they're thinking about like

222
00:37:29.300 --> 00:37:38.169
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): the top. 10% out of the drivers get have some level of total caps, that or discounts. Of course

223
00:37:39.450 --> 00:37:46.799
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: that's a really interesting idea that you've mentioned about toll caps

224
00:37:46.820 --> 00:37:53.020

Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: and definitely worth exploring. But my own sense of this is a case where

225
00:37:53.580 --> 00:37:58.070
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: we want to. It's the whole principle is that we keep, you know, encouraging people to stop

226
00:37:58.120 --> 00:38:08.490
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: to not drive as much, and if we do a toll cap. We are essentially telling people after some amount, you know, in a month or a year they can drive as much as they want for free.

227
00:38:08.500 --> 00:38:23.300
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: And so again, tool caps may or may not be the right answer, but I think it's really important to think about how the way we set the rates will influence people's behavior, and whether we risk undermining the benefits that we're trying to achieve

228
00:38:24.880 --> 00:38:28.650
Stuart Cohen (he/him): all right, a little challenge to toll caps there

229
00:38:28.720 --> 00:38:37.499
Stuart Cohen (he/him): from the economics thinker. All right. Great? Well, well, Rachel, you gave us a really good.

230
00:38:37.570 --> 00:38:53.209
Stuart Cohen (he/him): you know, learning about the engagement you've done, and some of the rate structures. I'd love to see if there's just anything else that you really think we should learn from the Sf. Studies that you've done, that we can kind of carry into this next Gen. Study that I knew was leading.

231
00:38:54.030 --> 00:39:02.660
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: Yes. Well, one of the I shows you raised is that that performance of the

232
00:39:02.730 --> 00:39:10.160
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: transportation network is ultimately the goal of the congestion pricing, you know, intervention. So for San Francisco's

233

00:39:10.170 --> 00:39:26.739
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: downtown congestion pricing study managing congestion was that was the primary goal, and then we needed to do it in a way that was equitable and implementable, right feasible to implement, and had manageable costs and so forth

234
00:39:27.400 --> 00:39:34.799
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: it. We did find that it was a big challenge to balance sort of a a lot of the special needs.

235
00:39:35.410 --> 00:39:40.789
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: and you know, equity considerations with performance.

236
00:39:40.810 --> 00:39:51.610
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: And so we did look very carefully at how different combinations and different magnitudes of you know equity.

237
00:39:51.740 --> 00:40:08.299
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: provisions, whether that be discounts to the fee itself, exemptions of of some kind or another, or just ways that the revenue was reinvested. How that balanced, you know, with performance, and it was a very difficult

238
00:40:08.460 --> 00:40:13.779
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: balance to strike, because we would see, you know

239
00:40:14.010 --> 00:40:19.040
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: you know, more driving, of course, right and and less congestion.

240
00:40:19.190 --> 00:40:23.029
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: benefit and less Vmt. Reduction with

241
00:40:23.400 --> 00:40:31.400
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: more more discounts, and not all discounts were equally equitable, right as well, so that that was a a

242
00:40:31.530 --> 00:40:32.209
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: tough

243
00:40:32.260 --> 00:40:34.629
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: set of analyses for us.

244
00:40:34.840 --> 00:40:35.479
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Yes.

245
00:40:35.780 --> 00:40:47.530
Stuart Cohen (he/him): all right. Well, thank you all, and I gonna get to the audience questions. Now, there are some really great ones, a lot of them focus on the next Jen study.

246
00:40:47.590 --> 00:40:55.419
Stuart Cohen (he/him): and I do. Why, Don't, we start with kind of the medical, that kind of kicked really the pricing study off which is

247
00:40:55.540 --> 00:40:59.730
Stuart Cohen (he/him): reducing vehicle miles, travel, meeting climate targets. And

248
00:40:59.770 --> 00:41:01.740
Stuart Cohen (he/him): is there a draft target

249
00:41:02.020 --> 00:41:08.209
Stuart Cohen (he/him): for how much of bmt we'd be looking to reduce or Co. 2 with pricing?

250
00:41:11.450 --> 00:41:21.600
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): There is a state mandated target on emission reductions, transportation emission reductions that we're shooting for from transportation related strategies, not

251
00:41:21.610 --> 00:41:33.349
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): electric vehicle strategies, and and that is 19 by 2,035 relative to 2,005 levels that you may be aware of. That's my legislation.

252
00:41:33.740 --> 00:41:38.069
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Now there's no target for what is what is to be done by pricing alone.

253
00:41:39.500 --> 00:41:45.059
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): But pricing in our plan was one of the most critical strategies. It was

254
00:41:45.150 --> 00:41:55.819
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): when we looked at the emission reductions from different types of strategies. The pricing strategy alone contributed to more emission reductions than

255
00:41:55.900 --> 00:41:58.410
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): all of the transcendence we had in there.

256
00:41:58.550 --> 00:42:03.139
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): But of course, pricing rings on a lot of issues that we need to consider

257
00:42:04.110 --> 00:42:05.049
Stuart Cohen (he/him): All right.

258
00:42:06.230 --> 00:42:08.709
So

259
00:42:08.840 --> 00:42:28.200
Stuart Cohen (he/him): let's say, you know, either for political reasons or others, that this study doesn't move forward. Somebody kind of is essentially asking, and we pick the non pricing option. What might Mtc do to fill that void? How would we meet the Mt Goals set by the State? Then, of course, just for our need for climate protection.

260
00:42:29.300 --> 00:42:34.380
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): I mean, that's a very solid question for us to answer in our next reason. With them

261
00:42:34.400 --> 00:42:54.010
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): time bare 2050, plus, I think, as of now, we in our past plan. We did not see another way of meeting that goal, and that's why we included that strategy in the plan. But if it were not for that, it would probably be leading more into land use strategies as well as

262
00:42:54.190 --> 00:42:57.890
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): other funding resources to reasonable funding for transit.

263
00:42:58.600 --> 00:43:10.150
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Yeah, and and just kind of the complimentary answer is that you know, every 4 years this Plan Bay area is updated. Our regional plan, and so we'd probably kind of wait until then. Like to explore.

264
00:43:10.380 --> 00:43:12.249
Stuart Cohen (he/him): you know. Why are those other solutions?

265
00:43:13.430 --> 00:43:21.299
Stuart Cohen (he/him): And and here's something that all of you, you know, might want to answer, although we only need one really to give the good one, which is.

266
00:43:22.390 --> 00:43:26.879
Stuart Cohen (he/him): if we get some cars off the road. Doesn't this Just induce

267
00:43:26.970 --> 00:43:32.520
Stuart Cohen (he/him): new demand from people, maybe, who didn't want to sit in the congestion, but are now willing to come on.

268
00:43:32.690 --> 00:43:35.929
Stuart Cohen (he/him): and so can we really get rid of congestion through pricing?

269
00:43:37.580 --> 00:43:38.790
Stuart Cohen (he/him): No, let anybody take that.

270
00:43:41.380 --> 00:43:44.740
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: Well, I could offer something here.

271
00:43:44.870 --> 00:44:00.420
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: Now this is pointing to an experience of a different city that has done congestion pricing. So so London, which is, is not a analog for any city here in California, but in what happened there was that

272
00:44:00.430 --> 00:44:05.140
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: they made a huge investment in their bus system at the same time that they started

273
00:44:05.550 --> 00:44:22.500
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: their congestion pricing. And so at they did see a a significant reduction in vehicle traffic. And so what they did as they added new buses and saw that reduction in vehicle traffic was, They took some of that space street space that was freed up and made bus lanes.

274
00:44:22.570 --> 00:44:26.949
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: So they they also, you know, basically made the amount of space

275
00:44:27.340 --> 00:44:38.290
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: available to vehicles smaller and prioritize transit. So it was a sort of cycle there where transit was getting better, and they were putting more investment into that, and ridership increased in and vehicle. 250

276
00:44:38.300 --> 00:44:55.129
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: trips went down. They did see congest, you know, the remaining Vehicle Street space available still does get congested, but what and they've needed to modify their price levels

277
00:44:55.170 --> 00:44:57.550
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: to respond to that and keep

278
00:44:57.580 --> 00:45:10.519
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: a minimum amount of, You know, a a delay or speed. You know that that's something that here in the Us the express lanes do is there's a speed

279
00:45:10.660 --> 00:45:19.159
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: target that the price adjusts in order to meet, and in the case of a cordon style that

280
00:45:19.310 --> 00:45:23.419
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: has also been used in London, where they've adjusted the price as

281

00:45:23.680 --> 00:45:34.149
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: vehicle traffic comes back. But the way that they get the overall system to work better and move more people is by gradually also reducing the amount of

282
00:45:34.160 --> 00:45:43.799
Rachel Hiatt, SFCTA: space that's just for vehicles and prioritizing, putting priority to transit. And and now. They're doing other modes, you know, with bike bike boulevards and such

283
00:45:44.980 --> 00:45:45.680
Stuart Cohen (he/him): right?

284
00:45:46.060 --> 00:45:54.280
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Okay, if if there's not another one, we've got a lot of questions coming in, so i'll. I'll move on to another one.

285
00:45:55.540 --> 00:46:13.520
Stuart Cohen (he/him): So on new. This is really for you, you know people's time has value, and are we able to include the time savings in the calculation that we're kind of looking for a cost. Benefit analysis here and and including, you know, is there any equity component to that.

286
00:46:14.770 --> 00:46:32.229
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Yeah, definitely. I mean, that's okay. That's a big part of it, right? When we are talking about people paying toll for time savings last time, saying is gonna have value. And so big part of the question through our analysis is that time savings worth the incremental cost that we have to pay.

287
00:46:32.240 --> 00:46:44.670
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And so I think many people. When we we take when we talk about pricing with larger communities, their first response is always about this additional cost, and we're not thinking about the time savings at all.

288
00:46:45.160 --> 00:46:48.870
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): So yeah, that is definitely an equation in the analysis.

289
00:46:49.000 --> 00:46:54.790
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: and i'll just throw in a couple of other quick thoughts about this one is that.

290
00:46:55.300 --> 00:47:07.890
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: you know, although low income travelers weeds per hour is low, they often frankly have less capacity to sort of cope with being late to work.

291
00:47:07.930 --> 00:47:09.639
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: or you know

292
00:47:09.940 --> 00:47:17.279
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: things like that, where so their value of time may actually be in some cases

293
00:47:17.310 --> 00:47:22.959
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: higher sort of in terms of their ability to lead, you know, a good life and fulfill their responsibilities

294
00:47:22.980 --> 00:47:41.219
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: than somebody who's high income, or you know, and like to work, you know, perhaps doesn't really matter so much. So it's. It's interesting, because there are all these economic studies that do look at the value of time saved. But those can potentially kind of also perpetuate in equities by devaluing

295
00:47:41.270 --> 00:47:47.299
the time of low income travelers. So we just have to be thoughtful about how we do those analyses

296
00:47:48.460 --> 00:47:58.970
Stuart Cohen (he/him): right great. That was an important thing to add, All right. And this is a question that comes in about implementation, right? And we know there's great intentions.

297
00:47:59.010 --> 00:48:02.069
Stuart Cohen (he/him): And then there is implementation. And

298
00:48:02.610 --> 00:48:12.789
Stuart Cohen (he/him): you know, do we know that we can do what means based fee successfully? Can we really capture all, or most of the folks that deserve. That means base fees.

299

00:48:13.020 --> 00:48:15.599
Stuart Cohen (he/him): And has it been done well elsewhere?

300
00:48:17.040 --> 00:48:18.430
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Open that up to anybody.

301
00:48:22.190 --> 00:48:27.540
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: I'll just jump in quickly and say that I think it is a really big lift to get

302
00:48:27.750 --> 00:48:44.910
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: eligible people to apply. There are some examples we can look to. I mean, you telephone and and energy pricing there have been. Often. They're called like lifeline rates. So so we do have a history of those, and you know, administratively, they are feasible to do.

303
00:48:44.920 --> 00:48:49.260
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: But we also can look, for example, more recently at some

304
00:48:49.570 --> 00:49:07.189
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: discounted transit, fair cards for people who are low income in Seattle and other areas, and they have a very hard time getting people to sign up, and not, I think people don't want to save money, but they just don't know about it, or the process seems overwhelming. So that is something we need to think about really, carefully.

305
00:49:07.200 --> 00:49:22.259
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: and I will come back to my block pricing. So, box the nice thing there is that we don't have to. We don't care what anyone's income is, and so it is potentially a much administratively simpler and more kind of less invasive way

306
00:49:22.270 --> 00:49:27.790
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: to help keep at least a basic minimum of travel affordable for everybody.

307
00:49:30.310 --> 00:49:32.470
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Yeah. And how would you

308
00:49:32.770 --> 00:49:38.700
Stuart Cohen (he/him): verify income if if you choose a system that requires that kind of that income basis.

309
00:49:42.450 --> 00:49:47.659
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: I think I know, I know if you want to answer. I know Mtc. Has looked into this for transit here

310
00:49:47.690 --> 00:49:49.849
discounts. Do you want to answer that?

311
00:49:50.280 --> 00:49:52.890
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Yeah, I don't think we're there yet in this

312
00:49:52.920 --> 00:50:03.439
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): study in terms of thinking about that implementation. But and I can't speak to how we are doing it in any programs like clip or start, which is targeting

313
00:50:04.530 --> 00:50:06.399
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): households with less than

314
00:50:06.430 --> 00:50:09.029
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): 25% of median income.

315
00:50:09.870 --> 00:50:12.880
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: My sense is that usually people have to show up

316
00:50:13.380 --> 00:50:29.769
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: in person, probably somewhere and show, you know. Usually there's a variety of documentation, either income, tax receipt or show that you qualify for, you know, benefits like the fresh start program, or usually I think it relies on

317
00:50:29.780 --> 00:50:33.570
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: kind of other evaluations of your income that have happened.

318

00:50:33.820 --> 00:50:36.049
You know other government entities

319
00:50:36.620 --> 00:50:46.739
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): to go. Get yourself verified. That's certainly a challenge that has come up in our community discussions where either

320
00:50:46.920 --> 00:50:57.549
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): you may be undocumented, and so you don't have ways to show, or you don't have the time like I should just said it's important to even go and prove it, or there is also

321
00:50:58.980 --> 00:51:01.470
the

322
00:51:01.660 --> 00:51:02.739
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): how do I find it?

323
00:51:03.460 --> 00:51:10.109
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): And not not wanting to share for society in societal pressure? It's like not wanting to share that your low income

324
00:51:10.280 --> 00:51:12.259
and some people don't want to do that

325
00:51:12.970 --> 00:51:14.080
Stuart Cohen (he/him): right?

326
00:51:15.410 --> 00:51:21.309
Stuart Cohen (he/him): All right. So getting back to the equity issue, there's you know. It was mentioned that

327
00:51:22.230 --> 00:51:28.429
Stuart Cohen (he/him): a lot of low income folks have 2 to 3 jobs often, you know, needing to carry equipment.

328

00:51:28.630 --> 00:51:31.870
Stuart Cohen (he/him): And you know.

329
00:51:32.130 --> 00:51:36.009
Stuart Cohen (he/him): is there anything that could really be done that we haven't discussed already

330
00:51:36.040 --> 00:51:46.750
Stuart Cohen (he/him): for folks that really have no choice, you know, is there looking at kind of categories of staffing. But you know people that really have no choice, and how they get around can use transit.

331
00:51:50.100 --> 00:51:56.399
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): I mean the the first thing i'll say to that is in also bringing up the time savings we're talking about.

332
00:51:56.410 --> 00:52:15.230
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): That is a big part of the equity piece, right like. If they are driving, then they should get something that's worth that cost they're paying for, and then maybe they can get to one additional job or one for their job that pays more money, and that's that's how you get returns on the tools you you pay for.

333
00:52:15.240 --> 00:52:22.960
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): But then, apart from that, yes, to counter the cost of tools, it is strategies that I mentioned earlier already.

334
00:52:23.770 --> 00:52:36.399
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: The other thing I would just throw in is, you know, for any industry costs do rise, and it's always a challenge. But it it happens across the board. So let's just think of the restaurant industry. You know food costs rise.

335
00:52:36.540 --> 00:52:47.799
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: but it's sort of a level playing field in the sense that everybody is facing that same challenge. So if I am an electrician or what not, you know, and I now have to pay more

336
00:52:47.880 --> 00:52:50.530
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: to drive to my jobs, and I

337
00:52:50.550 --> 00:52:58.740
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: have to raise my prices a bit correspondingly. Well, you know, other electricians are probably going to be facing the exact same thing. So

338
00:52:59.060 --> 00:53:00.000
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: it's.

339
00:53:00.340 --> 00:53:05.039
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: I I think our industries can handle costs increasing. Nobody is happy.

340
00:53:05.280 --> 00:53:07.129
but we do it all the time.

341
00:53:09.400 --> 00:53:11.400
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): all right. So

342
00:53:13.190 --> 00:53:23.499
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): I saw this mentioned in one of the other questions like it, Congestion is that disincentive to to drive, and and so that's the stick we already have. But

343
00:53:23.510 --> 00:53:35.140
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): clearly, as we are seeing even traffic levels bounce back today to pre pandemic volumes. That is not a sufficient stick for drivers. Who

344
00:53:35.150 --> 00:53:53.009
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Who made this? Perhaps these short trips, because it's easy enough to make that free the to drive on the freeway. So maybe the price provides a larger disincentive for those drivers who don't really need to use the freeway to get off it, and that's your that's what we mean by

345
00:53:53.020 --> 00:53:57.520
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): making the toll worth for other drivers who need to drive and Don't have any choice.

346

00:53:57.950 --> 00:53:58.529
No

347
00:53:58.870 --> 00:54:09.619
Stuart Cohen (he/him): great. Let me just switch it a bit. I think one last question on how it might be administered, and I know it's really early in the study, I know.

348
00:54:09.680 --> 00:54:11.149
Stuart Cohen (he/him): But

349
00:54:11.220 --> 00:54:21.530
Stuart Cohen (he/him): what possibly the cost to administer a system like that? How much of that might be, you know, heat up some of the costs and what technologies are likely to be used. Now.

350
00:54:22.960 --> 00:54:37.069
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Yeah, we have. We haven't yet started that analysis. We do have a task in the study that is going to explore how this might operationally be deployed, and how much that costs, especially as we are talking about, you know not just administering a blanket.

351
00:54:37.080 --> 00:54:50.260
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): told everyone, but talking about discounts to specific groups and talking about toll credits for transit riders. All these things cost additional money to administer, and so we will be looking into that, and and

352
00:54:50.540 --> 00:54:53.859
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): perhaps putting out a number down the line of like what this might cost

353
00:54:54.880 --> 00:55:10.479
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: if I could just quickly chime in this isn't a direct answer. But a lot of states are looking at a mileage fee and the administrative cost for that, and they are huge variations. But I would say right now, roughly, 6%,

354
00:55:10.540 --> 00:55:17.180
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: you know something like that to administer a mileage fee. So it's not 50, you know it's not

355

00:55:17.340 --> 00:55:27.569
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: point 0 one either. Second point is, everybody assumes those costs will decrease over time is technology and such. And then, lastly.

356
00:55:27.580 --> 00:55:45.180
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: my hope is that we potentially move to a mileage fee at the State level, and then local entities are given the option to add essentially a a local add on. So maybe if you drove in the 9 County Bay area you would pay an extra penny of my whatever. I pull that number out of the hat.

357
00:55:45.190 --> 00:55:49.279
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: and for that the administrative cost would be extremely low.

358
00:55:49.370 --> 00:55:56.329
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: You know, if we have that underlying infrastructure to be collecting and mileage data and billing people, anyway.

359
00:55:56.390 --> 00:55:57.930
so something

360
00:55:58.030 --> 00:56:01.830
Asha W. Agrawal - MTI/SJSU: that in the future could make this actually quite affordable to administer.

361
00:56:02.070 --> 00:56:10.089
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Great. Thank you, Lasha, and one final quick question for you on it before I hand it over to Jonathan, for the closing is.

362
00:56:10.580 --> 00:56:21.859
Stuart Cohen (he/him): you know we're talking about congestion, but is that the only time we'd see new fees, or is the modeling now really about just using the freeway. No matter the congestion.

363
00:56:24.480 --> 00:56:32.209
Stuart Cohen (he/him): I'm sorry I don't think I understood the question. Is this just going to be a fee at congested times. Or is this just the study right now?

364

00:56:32.400 --> 00:56:41.620
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Yeah, I mean, we are evaluating that. But and different scenarios with that. But I would imagine it's there's there's no tool when there's no congestion.

365
00:56:43.250 --> 00:56:51.710
Stuart Cohen (he/him): Great! All right. Well, this is a great discussion. So far. I just want to hand it back to my colleague Jonathan, with closing

366
00:56:51.790 --> 00:56:54.579
Stuart Cohen (he/him): comments and questions. Thank you. Thank you all.

367
00:56:57.700 --> 00:57:07.619
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: Thank you, Stewart. Thank you for for the terrific management of the conversation, and thank you to all of our our panelists here.

368
00:57:08.050 --> 00:57:21.209
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: I I think it. It's been both a great technical information and and some philosophical perspective. On this we we a new. We we usually like to make sure to leave our audience with ways to be engaged. Can you just

369
00:57:21.220 --> 00:57:29.869
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: remind us of the potential next opportunity that people might, the public might engage with the next Gen. Study.

370
00:57:30.140 --> 00:57:42.010
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): Yeah, we are planning our second round of engagement for summer of this year, and it should be interesting because that's when we'll have some numbers to talk about from our analysis and the kinds of impact that pricing can have.

371
00:57:42.060 --> 00:57:50.160
Anup Tapase, MTC (he/him): So yeah, please stay tuned, and we have. We have a website on the we have a web page on the Nbc website. So you can refer to that for updates

372
00:57:51.460 --> 00:58:11.129
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: wonderful. So so do please keep an eye out for for the summer announcements of your opportunity to be engaged. Rachel Hyatt mentioned the website that is still live, even though the downtown congestion pricing study in San Francisco is done. So

there's rich material there for you to learn about about some of their deep needs, based work and and

373
00:58:11.140 --> 00:58:20.159
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: management work. And of course, as it has a lot of wonderful research that you can pull up on the web to inform yourself further.

374
00:58:20.550 --> 00:58:28.129
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: Thank you again to everybody, and and thank you to our audience for showing up and engaging so so wonderfully. We look forward to seeing you at

375
00:58:28.170 --> 00:58:29.490
Jonathon Kass, SPUR: at the next Forum.

376
00:58:30.750 --> 00:58:31.729
Thank you.